



Comprehensive ABC Control Rule Amendment

April 2021

Mike Schmidtke, SAFMC Staff

ABC Control Rule Amd Process Overview

- 2018-2019 – Amd initiated, drafted, scoping conducted, put on hold awaiting NMFS guidance
- July 2020 – NMFS guidance on carry-overs and phase-ins
- Sept 2020 – Council direction to resume Amd development
- Oct 2020 – SSC Review of Recommendations
- **Apr 2020 – SSC Review of revised draft Action 1, SSC WG Report, and carry-over recommendations**
- Sept 2020 – Council review of drafted actions, alternatives, and SSC feedback



ABC Control Rule Amd Process Overview

- Considers 3* general actions:
 1. ABC Control Rule Modifications (now includes Council specification and application of the CR to rebuilding stocks)
 2. Phasing in ABC Changes (previously reviewed; not scheduled for discussion today)
 3. Carry-over of Unharvested Catch



Photo credits: Richard DeLizza,
Don DeMaria, Kate Quigley



Goals for Today

1. Review re-drafted Action 1 and recommendations
 2. Review conclusions of the SSC WG and consider how this information should be incorporated into Action 1 alternatives
 3. Review information and previous recommendations for carry-overs (Action 3)
- IPT will edit action/alternative language following the SSC meeting





Definitions

- Risk: Used to denote management risk and is the purview of the Council
- Uncertainty: Used to denote scientific uncertainty (of assessment results, projections, etc.) and is the purview of the SSC



<https://ecotalker.wordpress.com/2019/07/02/cartoon-for-the-day/>

Current ABC Control Rule

- (Tables 1 & 2) Based on assessment category
- Organized into assessment Levels:
 1. Assessed using age, length, or biomass-based model
 2. Unassessed, DBSRA (reliable landings and life history)
 3. Unassessed, DCAC (data deficient for DBSRA)
 4. Unassessed, ORCS (Only Reliable Catch Stocks; SG only)
 5. Unassessed, Decision Tree (No reliable catch)
- Inflexible, couldn't add new methods



Action 1

Modify the Acceptable Biological Catch Control Rule

Alt. 1. Status quo ABC CRs for Dolphin/Wahoo, Golden Crab, and Snapper Grouper (Tables 1 & 2)

- **Risk Tolerance:** P* adjusted by SSC's ABC CR criteria
- **Overfished Stocks:** Application not specified in an FMP or amendment (Comp ACL Amendment did not specify)

Alt. 2. Categorizes assessed stocks based on info used to evaluate and characterize assessment uncertainty (Table 3)

- **Risk Tolerance:** P* specified by Council using biomass and stock risk rating (Table 4); additional Options (2a-c) may be considered
- **Overfished Stocks:** Rebuilding plan takes precedence



Action 1

Modify the Acceptable Biological Catch Control Rule

- Alt. 1.** Status quo ABC CRs for Dolphin/Wahoo, Golden Crab, and Snapper Grouper (Tables 1 & 2)
- Alt. 2.** Categorizes assessed stocks based on info used to evaluate and characterize assessment uncertainty (Table 3)
- Alt. 3.** Current CR plus ORCS Level for all FMPs and with Tiers 3 (Stock Status) and 4 (PSA) replaced by a P* adjustment depicting Council's risk tolerance
- **Risk Tolerance:** Council specifies P* adjustment of 0-20%; added to SSC Tiers 1 (assessment) and 2 (uncertainty) adjustments
 - **Overfished Stocks:** Rebuilding plan takes precedence



Action 1

Modify the Acceptable Biological Catch Control Rules

- Alts 2 & 3 both remove Stock Status and PSA from control rule and incorporates Council risk:
 - (Alt 2) by setting P^* considering biomass and stock risk rating
 - (Alt 3) as a P^* adjustment added to SSC assessment information and uncertainty characterization adjustments



Action 1

Modify the Acceptable Biological Catch Control Rules

- Last meeting, SSC formed WG to address Cat 4/unassessed/ORCS
 1. WG Chair will present report
 2. SSC will ask questions and discuss whether/how to incorporate into Action 1 alternatives
 3. Any changes to previous recommendations?



Action 2

Allow phase-in of acceptable biological catch changes

- Currently developed alternatives listed in Discussion Document
- No discussion scheduled today; recommendations were made last meeting



Action 3

Allow carry-over of unharvested catch

Sub-Action 5.1. Establish criteria specifying circumstances when unharvested catch can be carried over from one year to increase the available harvest in the next year.

Alt. 1. No carry-over of unharvested catch

Alts. 2-5: Carry-over allowed if...

Alt. 2. the stock is neither overfished nor experiencing overfishing

Alt. 3. $B > B_{MSY}$ -MSST midpoint AND stock is not experiencing overfishing

Alt. 4. a fishery sector has experienced a regulatory closure due to catch exceeding the sector ACL within the previous 3 years

Alt. 5. total landings over the previous 3 years $<$ landed catch component of ABC; carry-over conducted by sector and not allowed during a phase-in



Action 3

Allow carry-over of unharvested catch

Sub-Action 5.2. Specify limits on the amount of unharvested catch that may be carried over from one year to increase the available harvest in the next year.

Alt. 1. No carry-over of unharvested catch.

Alts. 2-4: Carry-over allowed for...

Alt. 2. an individual fishery sector using the ACL-ABC buffer

Alt. 3. an individual fishery sector that results in an adjusted ACL that exceeds the original ABC for the year receiving unharvested catch

- If the OFL is unknown, the revised ABC may not exceed 105% (**Option 1**), 110% (**Option 2**), or 120% (**Option 3**) of the original ABC, or no carry-over will be allowed (**Option 4**)

Alt. 4. an individual fishery sector of up to 25% of the sector ACL



Action 3 – Current Recommendations

Allow carry-over of unharvested catch

- Support if applied to stocks that are neither overfished nor overfishing, and have catch close to the ACL.
- Species biology is a factor, and the stock consequences of carry-over will differ between short-lived and long-lived stocks.
- Request updated stock projections to evaluate carry-over and to provide a basis for ABC recommendations in years after carry-over occurs.
- Consider the precision of catch estimates when allowing carry-over of a percentage of the ACL (Sub-Action 3.2-Alternative 3).
- Add term of reference to future assessment reviews and ABC recommendations addressing whether carry-over should be allowed for a stock.
- Consider the B_{MSY} -MSST midpoint as a threshold for carry-over; no carry-over if biomass below or estimated to fall below midpoint

Any edits/additions?



Action 3 – Discussion Questions

Allow carry-over of unharvested catch

- Does the SSC want to add to, revise, or remove any of the previously provided recommendations for Action 3?
- Are there recommendations on how precision of catch estimates should be considered with respect to carry-overs?
 - Is there a threshold of imprecision beyond which carry-over should not be allowed (e.g. no carry-over for stocks with a PSE greater than X)?
 - How should uncertainty of catch estimates be considered in determining the allowable carry-over amount?
 - Other considerations of catch uncertainty for carry-overs?

