



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

4055 Faber Place Drive #201
North Charleston SC 29405

Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520
www.sefsc.noaa.gov/sedar/

MEMORANDUM

TO: Bob Mahood, Executive Director, SAFMC
FROM: Kari H. Fenske, SEDAR Coordinator
DATE: November 15, 2010
RE: Schedule approval for SEDAR 25, South Atlantic Black Sea Bass and Golden Tilefish

Attached you should find the draft schedule for the SEDAR 25 benchmark assessment of the South Atlantic stocks of black sea bass and golden tilefish. This schedule has been produced through discussions with the lead assessment team with acknowledgement of other known meetings and time constraints and in accordance with the SEDAR to ensure that you will receive the final product by your December 2011 Council meeting.

SEDAR 25 will assess the South Atlantic stocks of black sea bass and golden tilefish. Workshop dates are: Data Workshop, April 25-29, 2011; Assessment Panel workshop, June 20-24, 2011; and Review Workshop, September 19-22, 2011.

The SEDAR 25 benchmark assessments are to be reviewed by your SSC, in conjunction with several CIE reviewers, the week of 19 September, 2011. This timing will allow the reviews and reports to be completed and available to your Council for their December 2011 meeting.

I would appreciate it if this schedule could be included for discussion and approval at your December 2010 Council meeting. Please inform me of the results of your consideration by December 30, 2010.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

cc

John Carmichael





Preliminary Project Schedule

South Atlantic Black Sea Bass & Golden Tilefish

Council and SSC approve TOR	Nov/Dec, 2010
*Data scoping call	week of Feb 14, 2011
*Data webinar	week of March 14 or 21, 2011
<i>Review data series lengths, length frequencies, and summary statistics</i>	
<i>[Note: SA Council meeting</i>	<i>March 7-11, 2011]</i>
<i>[Note: SA SSC meeting</i>	<i>April 5-7, 2011]</i>
*Data workshop – Charleston, SC	April 25-29, 2011
Final data due to data compiler by	May 13, 2011
Data spreadsheet posted to FTP by	May 20, 2011
*Pre-Assessment webinar	Week of May 30, 2011
<i>Discuss pre-base run set up and questions, DW and AW participate</i>	
<i>[Note: SAFMC June meeting</i>	<i>June 13-17, 2011]</i>
*Assessment workshop – Beaufort, NC	June 20-24, 2011
CIE reviewer at workshop, leave with base run set	
*Follow-up Assessment webinars – ~2 webinars per species	July 11-22, 2011
Finish uncertainty, projections	
CIE AW report to AW panel	Aug 1, 2011
Draft assessment report distributed to panel for review	Aug 8-19, 2011
Final AW report due to SEDAR staff	Aug 31, 2010
Assessment report to review panel	Sept 2, 2011
<i>[Note: AFS meeting week, Seattle, WA</i>	<i>Sept 4-8, 2011]</i>
<i>[Note: SAFMC September meeting</i>	<i>Sept 12-16, 2011]</i>
*Review workshop – location TBD	Sept 19-22, 2011
Review workshop report due to SEDAR	Oct 14, 2011
Final SAR report due to SSC	Oct 17, 2011
Assessment reviewed by SSC	Nov, 2011
Presentation to SAFMC by SSC	Dec 5-9, 2011

* Would be noticed in the Federal Register



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

4055 Faber Place Drive #201
North Charleston SC 29405

Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520
www.sefsc.noaa.gov/sedar/

MEMORANDUM

TO: Robert Mahood, Executive Director, SAFMC
FROM: Kari H. Fenske, SEDAR Coordinator
DATE: November 15, 2010
RE: Council appointees for SEDAR 25, South Atlantic Black Sea Bass and Golden Tilefish

SEDAR 25 will assess the South Atlantic stocks of black sea bass and golden tilefish. Workshop dates are: Data Workshop, April 25-29, 2011; Assessment Panel workshop, June 20-24, 2011; and Review Workshop, September 19-22, 2011.

As the Council is responsible for appointing participants to the various workshop panels according to the South Atlantic SEDAR procedures, I am requesting the appointment of participants for all three Panels associated with SEDAR 25.

The suggested maximum number of participants for each Panel is as follows:

Data Workshop Panel: 15 participants

Assessment Panel: 8 participants

Review Workshop: up to 3 SSC members, with one serving a chair of the Panel

Please see the following pages for suggested participants.

I would appreciate it if these appointments could be included for discussion at your December 2010 Council meeting. Please inform me of the results of your consideration by December 30, 2010.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

cc
John Carmichael



Potential SEDAR 25 participants

Name	2010 Update?	Location	Affiliation	Role	Travel Order?
* indicates participation in 2010 BSB data scoping call					
DATA WORKSHOP					
Nikolai Klibansky		NC	Acad. - UNCW	Data	x
Paul Rudershausen*		NC	Acad. - UNCW	Technical, Data	x
Michael Burton*		NC	SEFSC	Technical, Data	
Linda Lombardi		FL	SEFSC	Technical, Data	
Gary Sheppard			NEFSC	Technical	
Paul Nitschke			NEFSC	Technical	
Brian Linton		FL	SEFSC	Technical	
Marcel Reichert*	x	SC	SSC	Technical, Data	x
Chip Collier*	x	NC	SSC	Technical, Data	x
Julie Defillippi		DC	ACCSP	Data	x
Joey Ballenger		SC	DNR	Data - State LH black sea bass	x
Paulette Mikell		SC	DNR	Data - State LH golden tilefish	x
Dave Wyanski		SC	DNR	Data - State LH	x
Laurie DiJoy		SC	DNR	Data - State LH	x
Jessica Stephen		SC	DNR	Data - State LH	x
Michelle Pate		SC	MARMAP	Data - State Indices	x
Kevin Kolmos		SC	MARMAP	Data - State LH	x
Gregg Swanson		SC	MARMAP	Data - State LH	x
Josh Loefer		SC	MARMAP	Data - State LH/Indices	x
Sarah Goldman		SC	MARMAP	Data - State LH	x
Julia Byrd		SC	MARMAP	Data - State	x
David Player		SC	MARMAP	Data - State	x
Alan Bianchi or Stephanie McInerny		NC	DMF	Data - State Comm.	x
Doug Mumford		NC	DMF	Data - State Rec.	x
Jack Holland		NC	DMF	Data - State Comm.	x
Julie Califf or Kathy Knowlton		GA	DNR	Data - State	x
Steve Brown		FL	FWC	Data - State	x
Beverly Sauls		FL	FWC	Data - State	x
Tony Austin		NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Michael Cowdrey		NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Chris Long			Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Joe Camp			Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x

Kenny Fex	x	NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Jimmy Hull		FL	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Rusty Hudson*		FL	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Frank Hester*	x	MEX	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Andy High ¹	x	NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Zach Bowen	x	GA	Industry	Advisory	x
Billy Higgins		FL	Industry	Advisory - both	x
Bobby Cardin	x	FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Bob Preston		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Joey Klosterman		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Chris Connell		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Chad Lee		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Erik Williams	x -FD	NC	SEFSC	Analytical	
Kyle Shertzer	x -FD	NC	SEFSC	Analytical	
Doug Vaughan	x -FD	NC	SEFSC	Analytical	
Amy Schueller	x -FD	NC	SEFSC	Analytical	
David Gloeckner	x -FD	FL	SEFSC	Data - Fed ALS	
Ken Brennan	x -FD	NC	SEFSC	Data - Fed HB	
Tom Sminkey	x -FD	DC	NMFS	Data - Fed MRFSS	
Jack McGovern	x -FD	FL	SERO	Technical	
ASSESSMENT WORKSHOP					
Tony Austin		NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Frank Hester		MEX	Industry	Advisory	x
Jimmy Hull		FL	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Rusty Hudson		FL	Industry	Advisory	x
Kenny Fex		NC	Industry	Advisory - black sea bass	x
Bob Preston		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Bobby Cardin		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
Chris Connell		FL	Industry	Advisory - golden tilefish	x
John Boreman		NC	SSC	Technical	x
Andy Cooper		CAN	SSC	Technical	x
Gary Sheppard?			NEFSC	Technical	
Paul Nitschke?			NEFSC	Technical	
REVIEW WORKSHOP					
Anne Lange		SC	SSC	Chair or Technical	x
Jim Berskson		VA	SSC	Chair or Technical	

Additional details regarding individuals from above

Data workshop

Academics

- **Nikolai Klibansky**, PhD student working with Fred Scharf
Dr. Sharf and Mr. Klibansky have been working on a CRP-funded project on BSB fecundity. Nikolai is interested and available. “I am definitely interested in being a part of the workshop and will make myself available for meetings within the range of dates you have suggested. We do, in fact, have a substantial amount of data that will probably be of use.”
- Paul Rudershausen – interested and available for DW, has done research on catch rates, selectivity and discard mortalities for black sea bass.

NMFS other

- Michael Burton – “I should be able to participate in April...Not sure if I have data that will be useable, but we should have developed more of our genetic connectivity analyses by then if you think those will be of benefit.”
- Linda Lombardi – “I have age, growth, and reproductive data that will be useful in this assessment.”
- Gary Sheppard -He is the lead NEFSC stock assessment scientist for BSB. Gary has a lot of experience doing stock assessments of BSB in the Northeast.
- Paul Nitschke - Paul Nitschke, also of NMFS-Northeast, has done assessments of tilefish in the Northeast. He attended the SEDAR 4 AW, and perhaps would be able to participate in this one as well.
- Brian Linton - SEDAR 22 (Gulf of Mexico golden tilefish) analyst

SSC Reps

- Marcel Reichert is willing and able to attend as an SSC rep
- Chip Collier is willing and able to attend as an SSC rep

Fishermen/AP

BSB –

- Tony Austin, a BSB commercial fishermen from NC, is willing and able to serve on both the DW and the AW.
- Michael "Chops" Cowdrey, a highliner in Sneads Ferry. Chops was vice chair of the LAP Workgroup. Interested in serving on the DW only.
- Chris Long. He fishes for BSB in the winter and charters in the summer.
- Kenny Fex has been very involved with SEDAR assessments in the past and is an AP member for S/G.

- Joe Camp, a bsb pot fisherman. He has been doing this for a long time and I (per Tom Burgess) think he would do a good job.
- Jimmy Hull - Captain Hull has been a Black Sea bass pot fisherman for many years offshore of Florida
- Rusty Hudson - has fished on Black Sea bass since the early 1960's and Golden tilefish since the early 1970's.
- Frank Hester - Dr. Hester already participated in the Black Sea bass update that was recently terminated in favor of conducting the benchmark next year. During the update webinar efforts, a

great deal of discussion about the data has already taken place during that process. He is willing to broaden his role with adding Golden tilefish to his effort at SEDAR 25. We (per Rusty Hudson) feel he should be included in both the Data workshop and Assessment workshop effort. The fishing industry supports his continued involvement.

- Andy High is a highliner and interested and available for the data workshop. “I will be available as much as I can. Due to some new regulations coming down the line, I will have to juggle the need for making money to support my family with the needs of the assessment group.”
- Billy Higgins – “I have a lot of experience with black sea bass with hook and line and we plan to fish more for tile fish (600’) this year. I have several inshore (less than 95’) numbers that produce black sea bass in the two pound range and we generally fish these spots on our way offshore or returning. We catch tile fish occasionally when we’re fishing in deeper water for Grouper. I recently purchased new equipment for fishing for tile fish. So I would be interested in participating in the black sea bass and tile fish assessments. I served on SAFMC Snapper Grouper Advisory Panel (Recreational) for about ten years. We have primarily bottom fished for Grouper and Red Snapper in the Central Florida Atlantic waters for over 20 years. I was a member for many years and President of the Central Florida Offshore Anglers Club for two years. CFOA is club of families and individuals who support offshore fishing, education and conservation. During my membership in CFOA I have taught our members techniques for bottom fishing. My specialty is deep jigging but our crew most always will have someone fishing with cut bait with double hook bottom rigs and another fishing with live bait.”

Golden Tilefish –

- Bobby Cardin - Bobby is in the SEDAR pool, has served on SEDAR assessments in the past, and is an AP member. He does not do golden tilefish fishing year round.
- Bob Preston - longline highliner in the fishery for the past 20 years. Bob and others were on the LAP workgroup for golden tilefish. He is willing and available for DW and AW.
- Joey Klosterman - longline highliner in the fishery for the past 20 years. He served on the golden tilefish LAP workgroup.
- Chris Connell is a hook and line fishermen in it for over 20 years in Florida. He is willing and available for the DW and AW. He served on the golden tilefish LAP workgroup.
- Chad Lee – longliner in the golden tilefish fishery. He served on the golden tilefish LAP workgroup.

States/Commissions/Misc

SC –

Marcel Reichert – SC DNR/MARMAP, also SSC

Joey Ballenger (SC DNR lead for BSB)

LH WG

Paulette Mikell (SC DNR lead for tilefish)

LH WG

Dave Wyanski (SC DNR, reproduction tilefish)

LH WG

Laurie DiJoy (SC DNR, reproduction BSB)

LH WG

Jessica Stephen (SC DNR, data management)

Indices WG

MARMAP has several others that can play a role, especially if the meeting is in Charleston:

Michelle Pate

Indices WG

Kevin Kolmos	LH WG
Gregg Swanson	LH WG
Josh Loefer	LH WG/Indices WG
Sarah Goldman	LH WG
Julia Byrd, David Player	SC DNR
NC –	
Alan Bianchi OR Stephanie McInerny	Commercial statistics
Doug Mumford	Recreational statistics
Jack Holland	Commercial port agent
Chip Collier -	LH WG, also on SSC
GA – Julie Califf or Kathy Knowlton	
FL – Steve Brown, Beverly Sauls	
ACCSP – Julie Defillippi (she’s available and interested in attending)	

Assessment workshop

Industry

Black sea bass

- Tony Austin
- Frank Hester
- Jimmy Hull
- Rusty Hudson
- Kenny Fex

Golden tilefish

- Bob Preston
- Bobby Cardin
- Chris Connell

SSC reps

- John Boreman is willing and able to serve as an SSC rep
- Andy Cooper is willing and able to serve as an SSC rep

Academics

-

NMFS

- Gary Shephard?
- Paul Nitschke?

Review workshop

SSC reps

- Anne Lange is willing to serve as chair or as a reviewer
- Jim Berkson is willing to serve as chair or as a reviewer

Suggested Participants List for SEDAR 25
SA Black Sea Bass and SA Golden Tilefish

Below is a list of potential participants for SEDAR 25. These people have either been recommended, participated in the past, or expressed interest in participating. Blanks under “Appointee” need personnel. Note: All slots may not be filled.

Data Workshop Participants – **Approximately 15 people (paid by SEDAR)**

Appointee	Function	Affiliation
<i>Analytical Team Representation</i>		
Kyle Shertzer	Black sea bass lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
Erik Williams	Golden tilefish lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
<i>Life History Workgroup</i>		
	Leader and Editor	SEFSC
(named by workgroup)	Rapporteur	
	Data provider	MARMAP
	Data provider	State rep
	Data provider	State rep
	1-2 Data providers	SEFSC
<i>Commercial Statistics Workgroup</i>		
	Leader and Editor	SEFSC
(named by workgroup)	Rapporteur	
	Data provider	ACCSP
	Data provider	State rep
	Data provider	State rep
	AP/Fisherman rep –	Com Tilefish
	AP/Fisherman rep –	Com Black sea bass
<i>Recreational Statistics Workgroup</i>		
	Leader and Editor	SEFSC
(named by workgroup)	Rapporteur	
	Data provider	State rep
	AP/Fisherman rep –	Rec Tilefish
	AP/Fisherman rep –	Rec Black sea bass
<i>Indices Workgroup</i>		
	Leader and Editor	SEFSC
(named by workgroup)	Rapporteur	
	Data provider	State rep
	Data Provider	State rep

**Suggested Participants List for SEDAR 25
SA Black Sea Bass and SA Golden Tilefish**

	Data provider?	SEFSC
<i>Data Management</i>		
Rob Cheshire	Data compiler	NMFS Beaufort
<i>Council Representation</i>		
	South Atlantic Council Member	
	SSC Rep	
	SSC Rep	
<i>Staff</i>		
Julie A Neer	SEDAR Coordinator	
Rachael Lindsay	Administrative Assistant	
Myra Brouwer	South Atlantic Council Staff Lead	SEDAR
	IT Support	NMFS Miami

Assessment Workshop Approximately 8 people (paid by SEDAR)

Appointee	Function	Affiliation
<i>Analytical Team Representation</i>		
Kyle Sherzter	Black sea bass lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
Erik Williams	Golden tilefish lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
	Analytic support	NMFS Beaufort
<i>Remaining Panel Members</i>		
	Panelist	
	Panelist	
	Panelist	
	Panelist	
	Panelist	
<i>Appointed Observers</i>		
	AP/Fisherman rep	Tilefish
	AP/Fisherman rep	Black sea bass
<i>Council Representation</i>		
	South Atlantic Council	SAFMC

**Suggested Participants List for SEDAR 25
SA Black Sea Bass and SA Golden Tilefish**

Member		
<i>Staff</i>		
Kari Fenske	SEDAR Coordinator	SEDAR
Rachael Lindsay	Administrative Assistant	SEDAR
Myra Brouwer	South Atlantic Council Staff Lead	SAFMC
	IT Support	NMFS Miami

Review Workshop – Approximately 6 people (paid by SEDAR)

Appointee	Function	Affiliation
<i>Review Panelists</i>		
	CIE Reviewer	
	CIE Reviewer	
	CIE Reviewer	
	SSC Reviewer	
	SSC Reviewer	
	Review Chair - SSC	
<i>Analytical Team Representation</i>		
Kyle Sherzter	Black sea bass lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
Erik Williams	Golden tilefish lead analyst	NMFS Beaufort
	Analytic support	NMFS Beaufort
	Rapporteur	NMFS Beaufort
<i>Council Representation</i>		
	South Atlantic Council Member	SAFMC
<i>Staff</i>		
Kari Fenske	SEDAR Coordinator	SEDAR
Rachael Lindsay	Administrative Assistant	SEDAR
Myra Brouwer	South Atlantic Council Staff Lead	SAFMC
	IT Support	NMFS Miami



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

4055 Faber Place Drive #201
North Charleston SC 29405

Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520
www.sefsc.noaa.gov/sedar/

MEMORANDUM

TO: Bob Mahood, Executive Director, SAFMC
FROM: Kari H. Fenske, SEDAR Coordinator
DATE: November 15, 2010
RE: Coordination information for SEDAR 25, South Atlantic Black Sea Bass

Enclosed are draft Terms of Reference for the SEDAR 25 Black Sea Bass workshops. Please review this information, modify if necessary, and approve according to South Atlantic Council SEDAR procedures.

I would appreciate it if these Terms of Reference could be included for discussion at your December 2010 Council meeting. Please inform me of the results of your consideration by December 30, 2010.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

cc
John Carmichael



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

South Atlantic Fishery Management Council
Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council
Caribbean Fishery Management Council
NOAA Fisheries
Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission
Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission

4055 Faber Place Drive, Suite 201
North Charleston, SC 29405
Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520

SEDAR 25 South Atlantic Black Sea Bass Terms of Reference

October 2010

Data Workshop Terms of Reference

1. Review stock structure and unit stock definitions and consider whether changes are required.
2. Review, discuss, and tabulate available life history information if new information is available.
 - e.g., Age, growth, natural mortality, reproductive characteristics
 - Provide appropriate models to describe growth, maturation, and fecundity by age, sex, or length as applicable.
 - Evaluate the adequacy of available life-history information for conducting stock assessments and recommend life history information for use in population modeling.
3. Recommend discard mortality rates.
 - Review available research and published literature
 - Consider research directed at black sea bass as well as similar species from the Atlantic and other areas.
 - Provide estimates of discard mortality rate by fishery, gear type, depth, and other feasible or appropriate strata.
 - Include thorough rationale for recommended discard mortality rates.
 - Provide justification for any recommendations that deviate from the range of discard mortality provided in the last benchmark and update (SEDAR2, 2005 Update).
4. Provide measures of population abundance that are appropriate for stock assessment.
 - Consider and discuss all available and relevant fishery dependent and independent data sources.
 - Document all programs evaluated; address program objectives, methods, coverage, sampling intensity, and other relevant characteristics.
 - Provide maps of survey coverage.
 - Develop CPUE and index values by appropriate strata (e.g., age, size, area, and fishery) and include measures of precision and accuracy.
 - Discuss the degree to which available indices adequately represent fishery and population conditions.
 - Recommend which data sources are considered adequate and reliable for use in assessment modeling.

5. Provide commercial catch statistics, including both landings and discards in both pounds and number.
 - Evaluate and discuss the adequacy of available data for accurately characterizing harvest and discard by species and fishery sector or gear.
 - Provide length and age distributions if feasible.
 - Provide maps of fishery effort and harvest.
6. Provide recreational catch statistics, including both landings and discards in both pounds and number.
 - Evaluate and discuss the adequacy of available data for accurately characterizing harvest and discard by species and fishery sector or gear.
 - Provide length and age distributions if feasible.
 - Provide maps of fishery effort and harvest.
7. Provide recommendations for future research in areas such as sampling, fishery monitoring, and stock assessment. Include specific guidance on sampling intensity (number of samples including age and length structures) and appropriate strata and coverage.
8. Develop a spreadsheet of assessment model input data that reflects the decisions and recommendations of the Data Workshop. Review and approve the contents of the input spreadsheet by TBD.
9. Develop a list of tasks to be completed following the workshop.
10. No later than TBD, prepare the Data Workshop report providing complete documentation of workshop actions and decisions (Section II. of the SEDAR assessment report).

Assessment Workshop Terms of Reference

Assessment Process I

1. Review any changes in data following the data workshop and any analyses suggested by the data workshop. Summarize data as used in each assessment model. Provide justification for any deviations from Data Workshop recommendations.
2. Develop BAM and ASPIC assessment models.
 - Document all input data, assumptions, and equations for each model.
 - Include a model configuration consistent with the SEDAR 2 benchmark as subsequently updated ("Continuity run") incorporating additional data observations.
3. Provide estimates of stock population parameters.
 - Include fishing mortality, abundance, biomass, selectivity, stock-recruitment relationship, etc
 - Include appropriate and representative measures of precision for parameter estimates.
4. Characterize uncertainty in the assessment and estimated values.
 - Consider uncertainty in input data, modeling approach, and model configuration.
 - Consider other sources as appropriate for this assessment.
 - Provide appropriate measures of model performance, reliability, and 'goodness of fit'
5. Provide evaluations of yield and productivity.
 - Include yield-per-recruit, spawner-per-recruit, and stock-recruitment models.
6. Provide estimates for SFA criteria consistent with applicable FMPs, proposed FMPs and Amendments, other ongoing or proposed management programs, and National Standards.
 - Evaluating existing or proposed SFA benchmarks as specified in the management summary.
 - Recommend proxy values when necessary.
7. Provide declarations of stock status relative to SFA benchmarks.
8. Perform a probabilistic analysis of proposed reference points, stock status, and yield.
 - Provide the probability of overfishing at various harvest or exploitation levels.
 - Provide a probability density function for biological reference point estimates.
 - If the stock is overfished, provide the probability of rebuilding within mandated time periods as described in the management summary or applicable federal regulations.
9. Project future stock conditions (biomass, abundance, and exploitation) and develop rebuilding schedules if warranted; include estimated generation time. Stock projections shall be developed in accordance with the following:
 - A) If stock is overfished:
 - $F=0$, $F=current$, $F=F_{msy}$, F_{target} (OY),
 - $F=F_{rebuild}$ (max that rebuild in allowed time)
 - B) If stock is overfishing
 - $F=F_{current}$, $F=F_{msy}$, $F=F_{target}$ (OY)
 - C) If stock is neither overfished nor overfishing
 - $F=F_{current}$, $F=F_{msy}$, $F=F_{target}$ (OY)
10. Provide recommendations for future research and data collection.
 - Be as specific as practicable in describing sampling design and sampling intensity.

- Emphasize items which will improve future assessment capabilities and reliability.
 - Consider data, monitoring, and assessment needs.
11. Prepare an accessible, documented, labeled, and formatted spreadsheet containing all model parameter estimates and all relevant population information resulting from model estimates and any projection and simulation exercises. Include all data included in assessment report tables and all data that support assessment workshop figures.
 12. No later than TBD complete the Assessment Workshop Report (Section III of the SEDAR Stock Assessment Report).

Review Workshop Terms of Reference

1. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of data used in the assessment.
2. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of methods used to assess the stock.
3. Recommend appropriate estimates of stock abundance, biomass, and exploitation.
4. Evaluate the methods used to estimate population benchmarks and management parameters (*e.g.*, *MSY*, *F_{msy}*, *B_{msy}*, *MSST*, *MFMT*, or *their proxies*); recommend appropriate management benchmarks, provide estimated values for management benchmarks, and provide declarations of stock status.
5. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of the methods used to project future population status; recommend appropriate estimates of future stock condition (*e.g.*, exploitation, abundance, biomass).
6. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of methods used to characterize uncertainty in estimated parameters. Provide measures of uncertainty for estimated parameters. Comment on the degree to which methods used to evaluate uncertainty reflect and capture the significant sources of uncertainty. Ensure that the implications of uncertainty in technical conclusions are clearly stated.
7. Ensure that stock assessment results are clearly and accurately presented in the Stock Assessment Report and that reported results are consistent with Review Panel recommendations.*
8. Evaluate the SEDAR Process as applied to the reviewed assessment and identify any Terms of Reference which were inadequately addressed by the Data or Assessment Workshops.
9. Consider the research recommendations provided by the Data and Assessment workshops and make any additional recommendations or prioritizations warranted. Clearly denote research and monitoring needs that could improve the reliability of future assessments. Recommend an appropriate interval for the next assessment, and whether a benchmark or update assessment is warranted.
10. Prepare a Peer Review Summary summarizing the Panel's evaluation of the stock assessment and addressing each Term of Reference. Develop a list of tasks to be completed following the workshop. Complete and submit the Peer Review Summary Report no later than TBD.

* The panel shall ensure that corrected estimates are provided by addenda to the assessment report in the event corrections are made in the assessment, alternative model configurations are recommended, or additional analyses are prepared as a result of review panel findings regarding the TORs above.



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

4055 Faber Place Drive #201
North Charleston SC 29405

Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520
www.sefsc.noaa.gov/sedar/

MEMORANDUM

TO: Bob Mahood, Executive Director, SAFMC
FROM: Kari H. Fenske, SEDAR Coordinator
DATE: November 15, 2010
RE: Coordination information for SEDAR 25, South Atlantic Golden Tilefish

Enclosed are draft Terms of Reference for the SEDAR 25 Golden Tilefish workshops. Please review this information, modify if necessary, and approve according to South Atlantic Council SEDAR procedures.

I would appreciate it if these Terms of Reference could be included for discussion at your December 2010 Council meeting. Please inform me of the results of your consideration by December 30, 2010.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

cc

John Carmichael



SEDAR

SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review

South Atlantic Fishery Management Council
Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council
Caribbean Fishery Management Council
NOAA Fisheries
Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission
Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission

4055 Faber Place Drive, Suite 201
North Charleston, SC 29405
Phone (843) 571-4366
Fax (843) 769-4520

SEDAR 25 South Atlantic Golden Tilefish Terms of Reference

October 2010

Data Workshop Terms of Reference

1. Review stock structure and unit stock definitions and consider whether changes are required.
2. Review, discuss, and tabulate available life history information if new information is available.
 - e.g., Age, growth, natural mortality, reproductive characteristics
 - Provide appropriate models to describe growth, maturation, and fecundity by age, sex, or length as applicable.
 - Evaluate the adequacy of available life-history information for conducting stock assessments and recommend life history information for use in population modeling.
3. Recommend discard mortality rates.
 - Review available research and published literature
 - Consider research directed at golden tilefish as well as similar species from the Atlantic and other areas.
 - Provide estimates of discard mortality rate by fishery, gear type, depth, and other feasible or appropriate strata.
 - Include thorough rationale for recommended discard mortality rates.
 - Provide justification for any recommendations that deviate from the range of discard mortality provided in the last benchmark and update (SEDAR 4).
4. Provide measures of population abundance that are appropriate for stock assessment.
 - Consider and discuss all available and relevant fishery dependent and independent data sources.
 - Document all programs evaluated; address program objectives, methods, coverage, sampling intensity, and other relevant characteristics.
 - Provide maps of survey coverage.
 - Develop CPUE and index values by appropriate strata (e.g., age, size, area, and fishery) and include measures of precision and accuracy.
 - Discuss the degree to which available indices adequately represent fishery and population conditions.
 - Recommend which data sources are considered adequate and reliable for use in assessment modeling.

5. Provide commercial catch statistics, including both landings and discards in both pounds and number.
 - Evaluate and discuss the adequacy of available data for accurately characterizing harvest and discard by species and fishery sector or gear.
 - Provide length and age distributions if feasible.
 - Provide maps of fishery effort and harvest.
6. Provide recreational catch statistics, including both landings and discards in both pounds and number.
 - Evaluate and discuss the adequacy of available data for accurately characterizing harvest and discard by species and fishery sector or gear.
 - Provide length and age distributions if feasible.
 - Provide maps of fishery effort and harvest.
7. Provide recommendations for future research in areas such as sampling, fishery monitoring, and stock assessment. Include specific guidance on sampling intensity (number of samples including age and length structures) and appropriate strata and coverage.
8. Develop a spreadsheet of assessment model input data that reflects the decisions and recommendations of the Data Workshop. Review and approve the contents of the input spreadsheet by TBD.
9. Develop a list of tasks to be completed following the workshop.
10. No later than TBD, prepare the Data Workshop report providing complete documentation of workshop actions and decisions (Section II. of the SEDAR assessment report).

Assessment Workshop Terms of Reference

Assessment Process I

1. Review any changes in data following the data workshop and any analyses suggested by the data workshop. Summarize data as used in each assessment model. Provide justification for any deviations from Data Workshop recommendations.
2. Develop BAM and ASPIC assessment models.
 - Document all input data, assumptions, and equations for each model.
 - Include a model configuration consistent with the SEDAR 2 benchmark as subsequently updated ("Continuity run") incorporating additional data observations.
3. Provide estimates of stock population parameters.
 - Include fishing mortality, abundance, biomass, selectivity, stock-recruitment relationship, etc
 - Include appropriate and representative measures of precision for parameter estimates.
4. Characterize uncertainty in the assessment and estimated values.
 - Consider uncertainty in input data, modeling approach, and model configuration.
 - Consider other sources as appropriate for this assessment.
 - Provide appropriate measures of model performance, reliability, and 'goodness of fit'
5. Provide evaluations of yield and productivity.
 - Include yield-per-recruit, spawner-per-recruit, and stock-recruitment models.
6. Provide estimates for SFA criteria consistent with applicable FMPs, proposed FMPs and Amendments, other ongoing or proposed management programs, and National Standards.
 - Evaluating existing or proposed SFA benchmarks as specified in the management summary.
 - Recommend proxy values when necessary.
7. Provide declarations of stock status relative to SFA benchmarks.
8. Perform a probabilistic analysis of proposed reference points, stock status, and yield.
 - Provide the probability of overfishing at various harvest or exploitation levels.
 - Provide a probability density function for biological reference point estimates.
 - If the stock is overfished, provide the probability of rebuilding within mandated time periods as described in the management summary or applicable federal regulations.
9. Project future stock conditions (biomass, abundance, and exploitation) and develop rebuilding schedules if warranted; include estimated generation time. Stock projections shall be developed in accordance with the following:
 - A) If stock is overfished:
 - $F=0$, $F=current$, $F=F_{msy}$, F_{target} (OY),
 - $F=F_{rebuild}$ (max that rebuild in allowed time)
 - B) If stock is overfishing
 - $F=F_{current}$, $F=F_{msy}$, $F=F_{target}$ (OY)
 - C) If stock is neither overfished nor overfishing
 - $F=F_{current}$, $F=F_{msy}$, $F=F_{target}$ (OY)
10. Provide recommendations for future research and data collection.
 - Be as specific as practicable in describing sampling design and sampling intensity.

- Emphasize items which will improve future assessment capabilities and reliability.
 - Consider data, monitoring, and assessment needs.
11. Prepare an accessible, documented, labeled, and formatted spreadsheet containing all model parameter estimates and all relevant population information resulting from model estimates and any projection and simulation exercises. Include all data included in assessment report tables and all data that support assessment workshop figures.
 12. No later than TBD complete the Assessment Workshop Report (Section III of the SEDAR Stock Assessment Report).

Review Workshop Terms of Reference

1. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of data used in the assessment.
2. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of methods used to assess the stock.
3. Recommend appropriate estimates of stock abundance, biomass, and exploitation.
4. Evaluate the methods used to estimate population benchmarks and management parameters (*e.g.*, *MSY*, *F_{msy}*, *B_{msy}*, *MSST*, *MFMT*, or their proxies); recommend appropriate management benchmarks, provide estimated values for management benchmarks, and provide declarations of stock status.
5. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of the methods used to project future population status; recommend appropriate estimates of future stock condition (*e.g.*, exploitation, abundance, biomass).
6. Evaluate the adequacy, appropriateness, and application of methods used to characterize uncertainty in estimated parameters. Provide measures of uncertainty for estimated parameters. Comment on the degree to which methods used to evaluate uncertainty reflect and capture the significant sources of uncertainty. Ensure that the implications of uncertainty in technical conclusions are clearly stated.
7. Ensure that stock assessment results are clearly and accurately presented in the Stock Assessment Report and that reported results are consistent with Review Panel recommendations.*
8. Evaluate the SEDAR Process as applied to the reviewed assessment and identify any Terms of Reference which were inadequately addressed by the Data or Assessment Workshops.
9. Consider the research recommendations provided by the Data and Assessment workshops and make any additional recommendations or prioritizations warranted. Clearly denote research and monitoring needs that could improve the reliability of future assessments. Recommend an appropriate interval for the next assessment, and whether a benchmark or update assessment is warranted.
10. Prepare a Peer Review Summary summarizing the Panel's evaluation of the stock assessment and addressing each Term of Reference. Develop a list of tasks to be completed following the workshop. Complete and submit the Peer Review Summary Report no later than TBD.

* The panel shall ensure that corrected estimates are provided by addenda to the assessment report in the event corrections are made in the assessment, alternative model configurations are recommended, or additional analyses are prepared as a result of review panel findings regarding the TORs above.