

# White Paper

## Development of Dolphin Wahoo Amendment 10 Snapper Grouper Amendment 44

April 2016

At their December 2015 meeting in Atlantic Beach, North Carolina, the South Atlantic Fishery Management Council (Council) discussed allocation issues facing the dolphin and yellowtail snapper fisheries. The Council discussed a proposed amendment in March 2016 in a joint meeting of the Dolphin Wahoo and Snapper Grouper Committees; however, no decisions were made and were deferred until the June 2016 meeting in Cocoa, Florida.

Attached is information that was given to the Council at their March 2016 meeting to help them and the Snapper Grouper AP with the discussion. There are tables showing landings by sector (and in the case of dolphin, also by commercial gear) are on subsequent pages following the discussion of possible actions the joint committee may wish to include in a new amendment.

One issue related to the possible development of an amendment is a discussion of how OY is operationally defined for the commercial and recreational sectors. In the past, there has been discussion by the Council regarding what might be considered optimal for one sector is not optimal for the other. Such a discussion could be beneficial in informing talks on revisiting allocation scenarios for dolphin, yellowtail snapper, and other species important to both sectors.

It may be premature for the AP to discuss in detail specific permanent/temporary allocation shifts between sectors for either fishery, as the Council has not yet decided if they will move forward with developing this allocation amendment. However, the SG AP may have broad suggestions for how the Council might look at allocations in the future, or offer other allocation mechanisms not discussed below. It would be useful for the Council to know whether the AP recommends the Council not consider permanent or temporary allocation shifts between sectors and why. Should the Council choose to move forward with an allocation amendment for that included yellowtail snapper (or any other snapper grouper species), the SG AP will get an opportunity to weigh in on that amendment at their fall 2016 meeting.

## **DOLPHIN**

The current allocation for dolphin is 90% to the recreational sector and 10% to the commercial sector. In 2015, the commercial dolphin sector was closed halfway through the fishing year because it was projected to reach its sector ACL. In recent years, the recreational sector has been landing about half of its ACL.

### **Commercial gear sector allocations for (longline and hook and line) (Table 1)**

When the commercial sector of the dolphin fishery closed on June 30, 2015, all commercial fishing for dolphin ceased for the rest of the calendar year. Traditionally, the longline gear sector makes the majority of their catches between late April and early July. The hook-and-line gear sector in the past has continued to fish throughout the year. In 2015, the hook-and-line gear sector was not able to fish as they had historically. The Council wanted to consider sub-allocations of the commercial ACL to the gear sectors so that increased landings by one gear will not adversely affect other gear sectors' ability to fish for dolphin.

**Table 1** shows the pounds landed (whole weight, ww) of dolphin by longline and hook and line gear types from 2005 through 2014 by month. In that 10-year period, when there were no closures, 62% of commercially landed dolphin was by longlines and 48% by hook and line. Only in May and June do longline landings have a much larger percent of the landings compared to hook and line-caught fish. The longline landings volume in May and June tend to be very large, whereas the hook and line landings are more evenly distributed throughout the fishing year.

### **Consider permanent or temporary allocation shifts between commercial and recreational sectors**

One way to consider allocation would be to allow temporary allocation shifts between sectors when it appears that one sector is not going to land its entire ACL while the other sector is likely to be closed. If a temporary allocation shift occurred, it would only be valid for the fishing year in which the shift occurred. The following season would go back to the regular sector allocations. Additionally, the Council could consider permanent allocation shifts between sectors such as occurred in Amendment 8.

**Table 2** is similar to **Table 1** except that it combines all commercial landings of dolphin and compares them to recreational landings by month for the years 2005 through 2014. The 2005 – 2014 10% commercial/90% recreational allocations matches the revised allocation put in place in Dolphin Wahoo FMP Amendment 8.

### **Establish a common pool allocation or reserve category allocation**

While Amendment 8 permanently increased the commercial allocation for dolphin to 10%, there are still issues regarding dolphin allocations that remain. The recreational sector typically does not land its entire sector ACL. Some interests would like to see if some of the uncaught ACL by one sector could be made available to the other sector. One way to consider such a situation is to create a common pool allocation or set aside some of the overall ACL into a reserve that would be tapped into by either the commercial or recreational sector only if it needed the additional pounds of fish to keep from going over its sector ACL.

## **YELLOWTAIL SNAPPER**

The current allocation for yellowtail snapper is 47.44% to the recreational sector and 52.56% to the commercial sector. The commercial sector closed on 10/31/2015 when it was projected to meet its sector ACL.

### **Consider permanent or temporary allocation shifts between commercial and recreational sectors**

One way to consider allocation would be to allow temporary allocation shifts between sectors when it appears that one sector is not going to land its entire ACL while the other sector is likely to be closed. If a temporary allocation shift occurred, it would only be valid for the fishing year in which the shift occurred. The following season would go back to the regular sector allocations. Additionally, the Council could consider permanent allocation shifts between sectors.

**Table 3** is similar to **Table 2** except that it compares commercial landings of yellowtail snapper with recreational landings by month for the years 2005 through 2014. The current allocations for yellowtail snapper are 52.56% commercial and 47.44% recreational. The commercial sector was closed for yellowtail snapper on 10/31/2015, it was not closed during the 2005 – 2014 time series used in **Table 3**. The recreational sector has not been closed for yellowtail snapper.

### **Establish a common pool allocation or reserve category allocation**

The recreational sector for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic has not landed its sector ACL. Some interests would like to see if some of the uncaught ACL by one sector could be made available to the other sector. One way to consider such a situation is to create a common pool allocation or set aside some of the overall ACL into a reserve that would be tapped into by either the commercial or recreational sector only if it needed the additional pounds of fish to keep from going over its sector ACL.

**Table 1.** Dolphin landings by month/year for the commercial sector by gear type

		2005		2006		2007		2008		2009		2010		2011		2012		2013		2014		Average 2005 - 2014	
		Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%
January	Longline	1,479	23%	447	10%	1,412	24%	5,422	55%	4,269	46%	1,660	40%	1,059	22%	10,738	56%	7,608	65%	9,161	73%	4,326	49%
	H & L	4,980	77%	3,847	90%	4,589	76%	4,353	45%	4,996	54%	2,511	60%	3,801	78%	8,544	44%	4,122	35%	3,462	27%	4,520	51%
February	Longline	1,129	11%	1,050	17%	4,105	54%	8,211	66%	3,073	31%	1,063	25%	770	12%	12,215	59%	9,996	73%	16,912	76%	5,852	51%
	H & L	9,344	89%	5,180	83%	3,450	46%	4,145	34%	6,921	69%	3,183	75%	5,555	88%	8,363	41%	3,730	27%	5,476	24%	5,535	49%
March	Longline	1,839	21%	841	9%	5,071	37%	11,626	73%	7,221	44%	2,063	34%	1,962	22%	15,754	61%	7,375	44%	22,432	75%	7,618	50%
	H & L	6,894	79%	8,316	91%	8,557	63%	4,292	27%	9,045	56%	4,053	66%	6,800	78%	10,004	39%	9,476	56%	7,375	25%	7,481	50%
April	Longline	6,077	33%	3,722	15%	10,991	35%	21,065	58%	12,181	32%	4,680	31%	6,309	39%	24,655	64%	10,269	42%	24,352	61%	12,430	44%
	H & L	12,285	67%	20,830	85%	20,435	65%	15,400	42%	26,210	68%	10,363	69%	9,765	61%	14,072	36%	14,293	58%	15,612	39%	15,926	56%
May	Longline	156,093	69%	130,068	55%	270,079	72%	214,966	75%	395,123	69%	232,718	72%	255,945	68%	273,571	80%	153,954	67%	483,578	87%	256,609	73%
	H & L	70,469	31%	108,094	45%	103,512	28%	73,393	25%	179,956	31%	91,576	28%	118,804	32%	67,765	20%	77,267	33%	70,702	13%	96,154	27%
June	Longline	70,494	43%	169,168	75%	236,318	73%	200,591	68%	279,368	73%	154,719	71%	49,216	38%	30,821	44%	128,555	77%	172,761	71%	149,201	67%
	H & L	94,899	57%	57,722	25%	87,927	27%	94,990	32%	101,566	27%	63,465	29%	80,835	62%	39,317	56%	38,093	23%	69,649	29%	72,846	33%
July	Longline	6,951	14%	11,212	26%	10,496	22%	4,268	15%	30,689	49%	5,341	17%	4,587	10%	7,632	29%	10,925	35%	9,855	25%	10,196	25%
	H & L	41,874	86%	31,532	74%	36,944	78%	24,759	85%	32,387	51%	25,662	83%	42,569	90%	18,908	71%	19,939	65%	28,837	75%	30,341	75%
August	Longline	1,844	9%	1,945	7%	3,184	15%	2,421	11%	2,907	21%	2,105	10%	3,269	8%	1,447	8%	5,819	24%	2,940	13%	2,788	12%
	H & L	17,892	91%	25,039	93%	18,535	85%	20,359	89%	11,239	79%	18,568	90%	39,962	92%	17,547	92%	18,171	76%	19,591	87%	20,690	88%
September	Longline	698	7%	648	10%	1,564	11%	1,789	9%	1,908	22%	2,832	32%	3,671	8%	2,530	19%	3,302	33%	2,749	21%	2,169	14%
	H & L	9,560	93%	5,684	90%	13,316	89%	18,705	91%	6,934	78%	6,126	68%	42,997	92%	10,685	81%	6,615	67%	10,536	79%	13,116	86%
October	Longline	1,137	15%	807	17%	1,239	11%	3,256	29%	3,514	35%	2,229	25%	5,351	31%	5,462	32%	3,414	24%	3,767	24%	3,018	26%
	H & L	6,421	85%	4,041	83%	9,677	89%	8,125	71%	6,588	65%	6,706	75%	12,023	69%	11,751	68%	10,706	76%	11,991	76%	8,803	74%
November	Longline	505	6%	564	11%	969	13%	2,705	23%	1,446	21%	4,441	35%	5,908	21%	4,194	43%	1,171	24%	3,368	33%	2,527	24%
	H & L	7,977	94%	4,457	89%	6,466	87%	9,060	77%	5,452	79%	8,150	65%	21,753	79%	5,624	57%	3,612	76%	6,759	67%	7,931	76%
December	Longline	196	4%	696	9%	702	15%	2,858	41%	1,438	29%	2,062	29%	14,944	65%	5,921	50%	5,526	63%	7,631	76%	4,197	47%
	H & L	4,683	96%	7,135	91%	4,091	85%	4,036	59%	3,585	71%	4,996	71%	7,876	35%	5,982	50%	3,254	37%	2,459	24%	4,810	53%
Annual	Longline	248,443	46%	321,170	53%	546,131	63%	479,179	63%	743,138	65%	415,912	63%	352,991	47%	394,941	64%	347,914	62%	759,506	75%	460,932	62%
	H & L	287,277	54%	281,875	47%	317,498	37%	281,616	37%	394,878	35%	245,360	37%	392,740	53%	218,561	36%	209,278	38%	252,449	25%	288,153	38%

**Table 2. Dolphin landings by month/year by commercial and recreational sectors**

		2005		2006		2007		2008		2009		2010		2011		2012		2013		2014		Average 2005 - 2014	
		Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%
January	Commercial	6,459	12%	4,294	4%	6,001	5%	9,775	8%	9,265	9%	4,171	5%	4,860	17%	19,282	15%	11,730	25%	12,623	48%	8,846	11%
	Recreational	49,069	88%	107,248	96%	119,434	95%	113,937	92%	93,938	91%	83,793	95%	23,334	83%	107,002	85%	34,723	75%	13,517	52%	74,600	89%
February	Commercial	10,473	7%	6,230	7%	7,555	2%	12,356	38%	9,994	4%	4,246	6%	6,325	19%	20,578	27%	13,726	26%	22,388	26%	11,387	10%
	Recreational	138,247	93%	79,560	93%	312,875	98%	20,054	62%	222,906	96%	62,834	94%	26,960	81%	54,557	73%	38,703	74%	62,557	74%	101,925	90%
March	Commercial	8,733	6%	9,157	7%	13,628	6%	15,918	9%	16,266	7%	6,116	16%	8,762	7%	25,758	12%	16,851	12%	29,807	24%	15,100	9%
	Recreational	139,721	94%	128,487	93%	234,121	94%	151,848	91%	224,867	93%	31,133	84%	116,475	93%	198,216	88%	125,005	88%	95,288	76%	144,516	91%
April	Commercial	18,362	4%	24,552	4%	31,426	6%	36,465	3%	38,391	6%	15,043	2%	16,074	8%	38,727	4%	24,562	17%	39,964	6%	28,357	5%
	Recreational	499,031	96%	662,217	96%	500,303	94%	1,027,783	97%	650,906	94%	608,830	98%	196,508	92%	894,238	96%	115,885	83%	589,941	94%	574,564	95%
May	Commercial	226,562	17%	238,162	10%	373,591	11%	288,359	19%	575,079	26%	324,294	23%	374,749	22%	341,336	17%	231,221	19%	554,280	50%	352,763	20%
	Recreational	1,078,394	83%	2,036,035	90%	2,928,191	89%	1,228,339	81%	1,668,952	74%	1,088,157	77%	1,348,228	78%	1,612,926	83%	955,128	81%	555,469	50%	1,449,982	80%
June	Commercial	165,393	8%	226,890	12%	324,245	15%	295,581	14%	380,934	18%	218,184	7%	130,051	7%	70,138	5%	166,648	17%	242,410	14%	222,047	12%
	Recreational	1,888,739	92%	1,639,280	88%	1,861,920	85%	1,770,794	86%	1,700,191	82%	2,909,746	93%	1,609,310	93%	1,216,979	95%	797,973	83%	1,501,502	86%	1,689,643	88%
July	Commercial	48,825	2%	42,744	3%	47,440	2%	29,027	3%	63,076	5%	31,003	6%	47,156	4%	26,540	7%	30,864	6%	38,692	6%	40,537	3%
	Recreational	2,744,368	98%	1,595,181	97%	2,189,882	98%	1,072,032	97%	1,282,260	95%	517,093	94%	1,121,318	96%	348,724	93%	444,596	94%	631,332	94%	1,194,679	97%
August	Commercial	19,736	2%	26,984	3%	21,719	4%	22,780	3%	14,146	4%	20,673	5%	43,231	7%	18,994	5%	23,990	3%	22,531	7%	23,478	4%
	Recreational	1,101,655	98%	771,091	97%	483,552	96%	869,278	97%	328,087	96%	356,509	95%	544,929	93%	393,352	95%	807,122	97%	321,223	93%	597,680	96%
September	Commercial	10,258	4%	6,332	1%	14,880	5%	20,494	3%	8,842	6%	8,958	4%	46,668	10%	13,215	4%	9,917	4%	13,285	9%	15,285	5%
	Recreational	257,054	96%	583,633	99%	286,277	95%	574,690	97%	145,211	94%	206,412	96%	423,711	90%	362,116	96%	231,474	96%	142,211	91%	321,279	95%
October	Commercial	7,558	4%	4,848	2%	10,916	4%	11,381	5%	10,102	10%	8,935	8%	17,374	4%	17,213	4%	14,120	9%	15,758	3%	11,821	4%
	Recreational	200,791	96%	256,066	98%	246,126	96%	236,732	95%	87,766	90%	96,653	92%	432,008	96%	442,311	96%	144,928	91%	435,318	97%	257,870	96%
November	Commercial	8,482	4%	5,021	5%	7,435	4%	11,765	3%	6,898	3%	12,591	36%	27,661	19%	9,818	12%	4,783	16%	10,127	18%	10,458	7%
	Recreational	192,767	96%	98,242	95%	198,379	96%	365,669	97%	197,768	97%	22,695	64%	116,541	81%	70,921	88%	25,097	84%	47,216	82%	133,530	93%
December	Commercial	4,879	4%	7,831	3%	4,793	6%	6,894	3%	5,023	2%	7,058	16%	22,820	11%	11,903	7%	8,780	6%	10,090	8%	9,007	5%
	Recreational	124,803	96%	237,135	97%	75,118	94%	248,417	97%	252,408	98%	36,624	84%	175,616	89%	160,428	93%	143,687	94%	121,176	92%	157,541	95%
Annual	Commercial	535,720	6%	603,045	7%	863,629	8%	760,795	9%	1,138,016	14%	661,272	10%	745,731	11%	613,502	9%	557,192	13%	1,011,955	18%	749,086	10%
	Recreational	8,414,637	94%	8,194,176	93%	9,436,178	92%	7,679,572	91%	6,855,259	86%	6,020,479	90%	6,134,938	89%	5,861,772	91%	3,864,320	87%	4,516,751	82%	6,697,808	90%

**Table 3. Yellowtail snapper landings by month/year by commercial and recreational sectors**

		2005		2006		2007		2008		2009		2010		2011		2012		2013		2014		Average 2005 - 2014	
		Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%	Lbs ww	%
January	Commercial	52,843	60%	58,660	80%	49,025	46%	53,701	49%	49,594	52%	46,429	68%	51,019	73%	79,114	70%	66,160	43%	42,750	36%	54,930	55%
	Recreational	35,728	40%	14,293	20%	58,555	54%	55,625	51%	46,257	48%	21,491	32%	18,580	27%	33,829	30%	86,017	57%	77,010	64%	44,738	45%
February	Commercial	61,897	66%	49,315	32%	41,135	31%	66,208	59%	35,819	31%	45,668	71%	48,897	36%	115,890	83%	100,077	75%	88,872	33%	65,378	49%
	Recreational	32,264	34%	103,610	68%	91,813	69%	45,071	41%	79,813	69%	18,229	29%	86,011	64%	24,398	17%	32,894	25%	176,889	67%	69,099	51%
March	Commercial	74,031	58%	76,143	49%	22,910	34%	62,711	56%	70,980	80%	63,469	71%	100,788	69%	143,277	57%	88,244	57%	98,636	72%	80,119	60%
	Recreational	52,864	42%	77,923	51%	44,033	66%	50,127	44%	17,387	20%	25,799	29%	44,559	31%	108,423	43%	65,741	43%	38,227	28%	52,508	40%
April	Commercial	66,916	61%	93,932	61%	55,730	54%	123,854	43%	113,124	70%	112,671	74%	142,416	83%	144,119	81%	147,505	65%	136,111	64%	113,638	65%
	Recreational	43,536	39%	59,491	39%	46,855	46%	167,090	57%	48,049	30%	39,035	26%	29,201	17%	34,536	19%	77,936	35%	75,596	36%	62,133	35%
May	Commercial	115,391	75%	93,218	69%	66,361	35%	98,918	65%	133,268	76%	200,611	74%	142,906	85%	195,404	64%	199,457	64%	175,225	51%	142,076	64%
	Recreational	38,321	25%	41,561	31%	122,766	65%	52,578	35%	41,952	24%	71,995	26%	24,754	15%	110,962	36%	111,666	36%	169,018	49%	78,557	36%
June	Commercial	98,532	63%	74,206	58%	115,556	42%	121,346	46%	133,169	73%	183,711	57%	111,853	78%	140,350	79%	174,877	49%	172,977	55%	132,658	57%
	Recreational	58,457	37%	52,686	42%	158,962	58%	142,809	54%	48,496	27%	137,379	43%	32,007	22%	36,678	21%	180,303	51%	143,114	45%	99,089	43%
July	Commercial	91,453	59%	42,118	53%	54,585	17%	102,815	22%	107,665	73%	97,021	52%	91,754	72%	149,331	73%	123,552	46%	103,646	44%	96,394	44%
	Recreational	64,810	41%	36,956	47%	262,611	83%	370,100	78%	39,796	27%	91,260	48%	36,356	28%	56,365	27%	144,987	54%	132,357	56%	123,560	56%
August	Commercial	50,907	54%	44,266	49%	40,868	44%	68,535	52%	100,407	79%	140,530	79%	84,204	68%	97,872	84%	108,309	66%	69,450	42%	80,535	63%
	Recreational	43,034	46%	46,108	51%	51,785	56%	63,741	48%	27,347	21%	38,179	21%	39,757	32%	17,955	16%	56,338	34%	96,507	58%	48,075	37%
September	Commercial	61,369	51%	54,825	58%	45,469	27%	74,581	61%	99,615	86%	70,507	60%	101,293	67%	120,555	77%	123,531	80%	70,608	71%	82,235	63%
	Recreational	58,589	49%	40,214	42%	120,827	73%	46,764	39%	16,386	14%	47,516	40%	50,352	33%	35,434	23%	30,360	20%	28,604	29%	47,505	37%
October	Commercial	31,305	52%	48,786	41%	36,049	41%	48,740	69%	89,293	81%	66,323	82%	92,895	85%	96,785	75%	76,223	69%	89,986	70%	67,639	67%
	Recreational	29,136	48%	69,131	59%	52,438	59%	22,131	31%	21,413	19%	14,647	18%	16,747	15%	32,992	25%	35,015	31%	39,122	30%	33,277	33%
November	Commercial	43,805	50%	33,474	37%	41,255	48%	39,447	52%	80,726	47%	61,722	56%	94,836	68%	71,916	45%	53,858	61%	80,584	77%	60,162	54%
	Recreational	43,477	50%	56,295	63%	45,100	52%	36,259	48%	89,858	53%	48,433	44%	44,133	32%	88,951	55%	33,758	39%	23,460	23%	50,972	46%
December	Commercial	69,172	63%	27,262	41%	60,435	62%	50,428	25%	71,697	85%	38,909	86%	63,259	80%	88,192	71%	67,338	73%	81,084	51%	61,778	58%
	Recreational	40,838	37%	39,829	59%	36,796	38%	151,215	75%	13,114	15%	6,420	14%	15,700	20%	36,311	29%	24,749	27%	79,316	49%	44,429	42%
Annual	Commercial	817,621	60%	696,205	52%	629,378	37%	911,284	43%	1,085,357	69%	1,127,571	67%	1,126,120	72%	1,442,805	70%	1,329,131	60%	1,209,929	53%	1,037,540	58%
	Recreational	541,054	40%	638,096	48%	1,092,540	63%	1,203,510	57%	489,868	31%	560,385	33%	438,156	28%	616,833	30%	879,764	40%	1,079,222	47%	753,943	42%