## Amendment 44 to the Fishery Management Plan for the Snapper Grouper Fishery of the South Atlantic Region

### Yellowtail Snapper



## **SG AP Overview Document**

### Background

The status of the southeastern yellowtail snapper stock was assessed through the Southeast Data, Assessment, and Review (SEDAR) process in 2019 (SEDAR 64), with data through 2017. Yellowtail snapper is considered a single stock in the South Atlantic and the Gulf of Mexico (Gulf). The assessment found the stock **not overfished nor undergoing overfishing**.

The current acceptable biological catch (ABC) for yellowtail snapper is based on the previous yellowtail snapper stock assessment (SEDAR 27A 2012). That assessment used landings information that has since been revised. Therefore, a new acceptable biological catch needs to be adopted that is based on the latest stock assessment and latest revised landings data.

The ABC for a stock is recommended by a Council's Scientific and Statistical Committee (SSC). Because the yellowtail snapper stock is distributed across two Council's jurisdictions (South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico), both SSCs had to agree on a recommendation for ABC. The South Atlantic Council reviewed the SSCs' recommendations in December 2020. This amendment is being developed jointly with the Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council but the summary of actions presented in this document pertain to the South Atlantic region.

## What are the possible actions in Amendment 44?

Snapper Grouper Amendment 44 considers the following:

- Modify the jurisdictional allocation of the acceptable biological catch between the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico regions
- Adjust the total annual catch limit (ACL) and annual optimum yield (OY) for the South Atlantic
- Revise sector allocations and sector ACLs
- Establish commercial management measures

### When would any changes take place?

Amendment 44 will be developed during the remainder of 2021 and 2022. Changes are expected to take place in mid-2023.

# What is the current and recommended acceptable biological catch?

The current ABC for yellowtail snapper is based on results of the SEDAR 27A (2012) stock assessment and is 4.13 million pounds whole weight.

The ABC is split 75% to the South Atlantic and 25% to the Gulf of Mexico. This jurisdictional split/allocation is based on 50% of average landings from 1993-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008. At the time this allocation was adopted, available landings included those from the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Survey. This survey was used until 2008 to estimate recreational landings. In 2008, the survey methodology was improved, and the program became the current Marine Recreational Information Program (MRIP). Below are the current ABCs for the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico:

South Atlantic ABC = 3,037,500 pounds whole weight Gulf of Mexico ABC = 1,012,500 pounds whole weight The survey methodology used by MRIP was again revised to improve estimates of recreational effort. The telephone survey of coastal households (Costal Household Telephone Survey, CHTS) was replaced by a mail-based survey, the Fishing Effort Survey (FES) in (2018). This change influenced recreational landings estimates. The latest yellowtail snapper stock assessment (SEDAR 64 2019) includes the revised recreational landings that are based on the current survey and is thus based on the best scientific information available.

In October 2020, the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico SSCs issued an ABC recommendation based on the latest stock assessment (Table 1). The ABCs decrease over time as removals from the population cause the biomass to move closer to the level that produces maximum sustainable yield.

**Table 1.** Annual combined (South Atlantic and Gulf) recommended ABCs for yellowtail snapper. Values are in millions of pounds whole weight (mp ww) and MRIP-FES units.

Year	ABC (mp ww)
2021	4.655
2022	4.242
2023	3.991
2024	3.836
2025	3.736

Note: ABC reflects the calendar year. Fishing year for yellowtail snapper for both commercial and recreational sectors is August 1 through July 31.

# What are the possible actions for the South Atlantic?

#### 1. Modify the allocation for yellowtail snapper between the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Councils' Jurisdictions

**Purpose of Action:** To divide the recommended yellowtail snapper ABC between the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico regions

**Option 1 (No Change).** Do not modify the jurisdictional allocation for yellowtail snapper between the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Councils' jurisdictions. **The current jurisdictional allocation between the South Atlantic and the Gulf is 75% and 25% of the ABC, respectively**. The allocation was established using the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Survey data and based on 50% of average landings from 1993-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008.

**Option 2.** Modify the jurisdictional allocation for yellowtail snapper between the South Atlantic and Gulf using Marine Recreational Information Program's Fishing Effort

Survey data and based on 50% of average landings from 1993-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008. The resulting allocations would be 81% of the ABC to the South Atlantic and 19% to the Gulf.

Note: For both options above, landings from Monroe County, Florida, are attributed to the South Atlantic.

#### **Discussion:**

**Option 1** would **retain the current jurisdictional allocation percentages** between the South Atlantic and the Gulf as 75% and 25% of the ABC, respectively, that is based on 50% of average landings from 1993-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008. This formula was applied to landings as of 2011 (when the Councils implemented changes to address the Reauthorized Magnuson-Stevens Act) to obtain the current ABC allocation in weight of fish. As explained previously, the allocation used recreational landings estimated by MRFSS, which has been since replaced by MRIP and the methodology improved.

Annual ABCs for the South Atlantic and Gulf under **Option 1 (No Change)** are shown in Table 2.

**Table 2.** Annual yellowtail snapper ABCs for the South Atlantic and Gulf based on current jurisdictional allocation **percentages** and recommended ABC (with revised landings). Values are in millions of pounds whole weight and include recreational landings estimates from MRIP-FES.

Year	Total ABC	South Atlantic ABC (75%)	Gulf ABC (25%)	
2021	4.655	3.491	1.164	
2022	4.242	3.182	1.061	
2023	3.991	2.993	0.998	
2024	3.836	2.877	0.959	
2025	3.736	2.802	0.934	

**Option 2** would use the **current allocation formula** but apply it to the **revised landings** that incorporate the MRIP-FES methodology.

Annual ABCs for the South Atlantic and Gulf under Option 2 are shown in Table 3.

**Table 3.** Annual yellowtail snapper ABCs for the South Atlantic and Gulf based on current jurisdictional allocation **formula** and recommended ABC (with revised landings). Values are millions of pounds whole weight and MRIP-FES units.

Year	Total ABC	South Atlantic ABC (81%)	Gulf ABC (19%)	
2021	4.655	3.789	0.866	
2022	4.242	3.453	0.789	
2023	3.991	3.248	0.743	
2024	3.836	3.122	0.714	
2025	3.736	3.041	0.695	

# 2. Revise the yellowtail snapper total annual catch limits (ACL) and annual optimum yield (OY) in the South Atlantic

**Purpose of Action:** To set the total ACL and annual OY for the South Atlantic. Because the jurisdictional allocation has not yet been determined, the options below present scenarios for both allocations options in the previous action (75/25 and 81/19 for the South Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico, respectively).

**Option 1 (No Change).** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is equal to the **current South Atlantic ABC.** The current ABC for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is 3,037,500 pounds whole weight (lbs ww).

**Option 2.** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is **equal** to the recommended ABC **based on the 75% South Atlantic allocation** 

**Option 3.** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is **equal** to the recommended ABC **based on the 81% South Atlantic allocation** 

**Option 4.** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is **90%** of the recommended ABC **based on the 81% South Atlantic allocation**.

**Option 5.** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is **80%** of the recommended ABC **based on the 81% South Atlantic allocation**.

**Option 6.** The total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic is held **constant at the lowest recommended ABC** (3,041,000 pounds whole weight).

#### **Discussion:**

**Option 1** would continue to specify catch levels for yellowtail snapper based on data that is no longer considered the best scientific information available (BSIA).

**Option 2** corresponds to the Council retaining the jurisdictional allocation **percentages** and retaining the 75% South Atlantic allocation.

**Options 3-5** are based on a jurisdictional allocation to the South Atlantic of 81% of the recommended ABC as a result of applying the current allocation **formula**.

**Option 3** would set the total ACL and annual OY at the same level as the ABC, whereas **Options 4** and **5** would allow for 10% and 20% buffers, respectively.

**Option 6** would maintain the total ACL constant at the lowest level of the projected ABCs. This catch level would be in place starting in the 2022/2023 fishing year and remain in place until modified.

Table 4 summarizes the total ACLs and annual OYs in the South Atlantic **by fishing year** (August-July) **based on the 81% South Atlantic allocation**. The total ACL and annual OY for the 2025/2026 fishing year would remain in place until modified.

	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6
	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total
Year	ACL/Annual	ACL/Annual	ACL/Annual	ACL/Annual	ACL=Annual
	OY = ABC	OY = ABC	OY = 90%	OY = 80%	OY=constant
	(75%)	(81%)	ABC (81%)	ABC (81%)	ABC
2021/2022	3,491,250	3,789,000	3,410,100	3,031,200	3,041,000
2022/2023	3,181,500	3,453,000	3,107,700	2,762,400	3,041,000
2023/2024	2,993,250	3,248,000	2,923,200	2,598,400	3,041,000
2024/2025	2,877,000	3,122,000	2,809,800	2,497,600	3,041,000
2025/2026+	2,802,000	3,041,000	2,736,900	2,432,800	3,041,000

**Table 4.** Total ACL and annual OY for yellowtail snapper for the South Atlantic based on options above and applied to the updated South Atlantic ABC from Option 2 of Action 1 (81% of the ABC). Values are in pounds whole weight and MRIP-FES units.

#### 3. Revise South Atlantic sector allocations

**Purpose of Action:** To adjust the allocations to the commercial and recreational sector based on the revised total ACL.

**Option 1 (No Action).** Retain the existing sector allocation **percentages (52.56% commercial and 47.44% recreational)** for yellowtail snapper for the South Atlantic and apply to the **updated South Atlantic total ACL**. The allocation is based on 50% of average landings from 1986-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008 using recreational landings estimates from the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Program.

# What are the current allocations and ACLs?

Commercial (52.56%) = 1,596,510 lbs ww

Recreational (47.44%) = 1,440,990 lbs ww

**Option 2.** Revise the sector allocations for yellowtail snapper for the South Atlantic. The **commercial sector would be allocated 40.73%** of the South Atlantic total ACL and the **recreational sector would be allocated 59.27%**. The allocation is based **applying the existing formula** of 50% of average landings from 1986-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008 to revised landings including recreational estimates from the Marine Recreational Information Program's Fishing Effort Survey.

#### Are there more options that should be considered?

#### **Discussion:**

Sector allocations under **Option 1** apply the current **percent** allocation to the **total ACL based on an 81% allocation to the South Atlantic.** Resulting sector ACLs if the total ACL is set equal to the ABC (Option 3 in previous action) are shown in Table 5. Data used to calculate sector allocations include revised recreational landings as estimated by MRIP-FES, and include landings from Monroe County, FL.

Table 5. Sector ACLs for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic based on current allocation percentages (52.56% commercial and 47.44% recreational) and total ACLs based on an 81% allocation to the South Atlantic and total ACL = ABC. Values are in pounds whole weight and MRIP-FES units.

Year	Total ACL (lbs ww)	Commercial ACL (lbs ww) (52.56%)	*Change in Commercial ACL from current	Recreational ACL (lbs ww) (47.44%)
2021/2022	3,789,000	1,991,498.40	+0.394	1,797,501.60
2022/2023	3,453,000	1,814,896.80	+0.218	1,638,103.20
2023/2024	3,248,000	1,707,148.80	+0.110	1,540,851.20
2024/2025	3,122,000	1,640,923.20	+0.044	1,481,076.80
2025/2026+	3,041,000	1,598,349.60	+0.001	1,442,650.40

\*Note: A comparison between current and proposed new recreational ACL is not appropriate because of different metrics between the old MRIP CHTS and new MRIP FES methods.

**Option 2** is based on applying the **formula**: 50% of average landings from 1986-2008 + 50% of average landings from 2006-2008 to the **revised (MRIP-FES) landings**. Resulting sector ACLs if the total ACL is set equal to the ABC (Option 3 in previous action) are in Table 6.

**Table 6.** Sector ACLs for yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic based on the **current sector allocation formula** and revised time series of landings, including MRIP-FES (40.73% commercial and 59.27% recreational) and total ACLs **based on an 81% allocation to the South Atlantic and total ACL = ABC.** Values are in pounds whole weigh (lbs ww) and MRIP-FES units.

Year	Total ACL	Commercial ACL (lbs ww) (40.73%)	*Change in Commercial ACL from current (lbs ww)	Recreational ACL (lbs ww) (59.27%)	
2021/2022	3,789,000	1,543,260	-53,250	2,245,740	
2022/2023	3,453,000	1,406,407	-190,103	2,046,593	
2023/2024	3,248,000	1,322,910	-273,600	1,925,090	
2024/2025	3,122,000	1,271,591	-324,919	1,850,409	
2025/2026+	3,041,000	1,238,599	-357,911	1,802,401	

\*Note: A similar comparison between current and proposed new recreational ACL is not appropriate because of different metrics between the old MRIP CHTS and new MRIP FES methods.

# How would the adjusted catch levels affect season length for each sector?

This analysis investigates when the commercial and recreational sectors will be expected to close under the proposed sector allocation changes for Options 1 and 2 using observed landings between 2014 and 2020 for both sectors (Table 7).

Yellowtail Snapper Commercial and Recreational Landings						
Fishing Veen	Rec. Landings	Comm. Landings	Total Landings			
<b>Fishing Year</b>	(lb ww)	(lb ww)	(lb ww)			
2012	1,129,915	1,439,586	2,569,501			
2013	1,695,188	1,328,974	3,024,162			
2014	2,122,485	1,544,038	3,666,523			
2015	1,495,150	1,652,438ª	3,147,588			
2016*	1,184,513	1,393,495	2,578,008			
2016/2017	1,491,509	2,336,970 <sup>b</sup>	3,828,479			
2017/2018	1,414,730	1,703,541°	3,118,270			
2018/2019	1,325,465	1,662,102 <sup>d</sup>	2,987,567			
2019/2020	1,309,326	1,435,167	2,744,493			

**Table 7.** Commercial and recreational landings in pounds (lb) ww of yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic for fishing years 2012-2020.

\*The fishing season for yellowtail snapper was modified in Regulatory Amendment 25, which took effect on August 12, 2016. For this reason, 2016 includes January through August 12, 2016 landings and 2016/17 fishing season landings are provided separately.

<sup>a</sup> In-season closure for commercial sector from October 31, 2015 to December 31, 2015.

<sup>b</sup> In-season closure for commercial sector from June 3, 2017 to July 31, 2017.

<sup>c</sup> In-season closure for commercial sector from June 5, 2018 to July 31, 2018.

<sup>d</sup> In-season closure for commercial sector from June 7, 2019 to July 31, 2019.

Source: SEFSC Commercial ACL Dataset (April 5, 2021) and SEFSC Recreational ACL Dataset (May 11, 2021).

#### **Commercial Sector**

Monthly South Atlantic commercial yellowtail snapper landings were averaged from 2018 through 2020 to project future landings for January and February months. Due to atypical landings in response to the 2020 pandemic, future landings were projected using average landings from 2017 through 2019 for March through May and August through December. Landings from 2014 through 2016 were used to project future landings for June and July due to in-season closures in 2017 through 2019 (Figure 1). Changes to the commercial fishing year (Regulatory Amendment 25, 2013) were assumed to have minimal impact on monthly fishing behavior, and no adjustments were made to monthly landings in 2016. Monthly predicted landings were cumulative summed for the fishing year (August 1 through July 31) until the landings met the ACL.



**Figure 1.** South Atlantic yellowtail snapper monthly commercial landings (lb ww) for 2014-2020, and projected future landings. Source: SEFSC Commercial ACL Dataset (April 5, 2021).

Based on the projected future commercial landings of yellowtail snapper under the proposed commercial ACLs the commercial sector would close as described in Table 8.

The 2021/2022 fishing year under Option 1 sector allocations (no action) was the only proposed ACL alternative that did not result in an in-season closure.

Option 1 (No Action): 52.56% commercial and 47.44% recreational								
Year	Commercial ACL	Projected Commercial Landings	Commercial Closure Date	Recreational ACL	Projected Recreational Landings	Recreational Closure Date	Total Landings	% Combined ACL Landed
2021/2022	1.991	1.960	No Closure	1.797	1.345	No Closure	3.788	88%
2022/2023	1.815	1.815	June 29	1.638	1.345	No Closure	3.453	92%
2023/2024	1.707	1.707	June 14	1.541	1.345	No Closure	3.248	94%
2024/2025	1.641	1.641	June 5	1.481	1.345	No Closure	3.122	96%
2025+	1.598	1.598	May 29	1.443	1.345	No Closure	3.041	97%
Option 2: 40.73% commercial and 59.27% recreational								
Year	Commercial ACL	Projected Commercial Landings	Commercial Closure Date	Recreational ACL	Projected Recreational Landings	Recreational Closure Date	Total Landings	% Combined ACL Landed
2021/2022	1.543	1.543	May 19	2.246	1.345	No Closure	3.789	76%
2022/2023	1.406	1.406	April 27	2.047	1.345	No Closure	3.453	80%
2023/2024	1.323	1.323	April 17	1.925	1.345	No Closure	3.248	82%
2024/2025	1.272	1.272	April 12	1.851	1.345	No Closure	3.123	84%
2025+	1.238	1.238	April 8	1.802	1.345	No Closure	3.040	85%

11

**Table 8.** The projected South Atlantic yellowtail snapper commercial and recreational landings (mp ww) and closure dates expected with each proposed annual catch limit alternative.

Snapper Grouper Amendment 44 Decision Document September 2021

#### **Commercial Trip Limits**

Figures 2 and 3 show the distribution of commercial trips in the South Atlantic for yellowtail snapper based on data from August 2014 to August 2019. Most commercial trips landed 200 pounds or less of yellowtail snapper during this period. However, a notable number of trips landed at least 1,500 pounds of yellowtail snapper (Figure 2). These trips contributed the most to the overall pounds of yellowtail snapper landed commercially from 2014 through 2019 (Figure 3) accounting for 30% of total pounds on average with a range between 21% to 38%.



**Figure 2.** Pounds per trip of yellowtail snapper in the South Atlantic from July 2014 through August 2019. Data are from the satl\_sero1420\_jan21 logbook file. Error bars are 1.96 \* standard deviation to represent 95% confidence interval. The first bin on the left is 1-50 lbs and then each subsequent bin represents 51-150 lbs.



**Figure 3.** Cumulative pounds of yellowtail snapper per trip in the South Atlantic from July 2014 through August 2019. Data are from the satl\_sero1420\_jan21 logbook file. Error bars are 1.96 \* standard deviation to represent 95% confidence interval. The first bin on the left is 1-50 lbs and then each subsequent bin represents 51-150 lbs.

# What management measures could help keep commercial landings from reaching the ACL?

The Council is requesting feedback from commercial fishermen on the following:

Should there be a commercial trip limit trip during May 15 to July 31 to coincide with the yellowtail snapper spawning season?

What would be a reasonable trip limit for the commercial sector, and should there be a trip limit step-down after 75% of ACL is met is met?

Should there be a trip limit for part-time fishermen? Would 500 or 400 pounds be appropriate?

Should there be a trip limit for multi-day fishermen who operate dually permitted vessels (SA and Gulf)? Would 3,500 lbs per week be appropriate?

#### **Recreational Sector**

This dataset includes landings from the Southeast Region Headboat Survey (SRHS) and Marine Recreational Information Program (MRIP). MRIP waves were used to estimate to monthly landings by assuming equal daily catch rates for months within a wave, and then SRHS landings were added back in. Average monthly landings from 2018-2020 were used as a proxy for future landings for most months, except for March and April when 2017-2019 data were used due to atypical landings in response to the 2020 pandemic (Figure 4). Changes to the recreational fishing year (Regulatory Amendment 25, 2013) were assumed to not have impacted monthly fishing behavior since the recreational sector has never reached their ACL.

Based on the cumulatively summed projected recreational landings of yellowtail snapper, the recreational sector would not be expected to close under the proposed recreational ACLs (Table 8).



**Figure 4.** South Atlantic yellowtail snapper monthly recreational landings (lb ww) for 2017-2020, and projected future landings. Source: SEFSC Recreational ACL Dataset (May 11, 2021).