

SAFMC-GMFMC SSC Workshop

Organizing Committee Planning Call 1: June 26, 2017

FINAL MEETING SUMMARY

AGENDA

- 1) Workshop Dates: 2nd or 3rd week Nov 2017 / Duration?
- 2) Workshop Location: Atlanta GA
- 3) Workshop Topics
 - 1) Alternative MRIP estimation for ACLs
 - 2) MRIP minimum PSE standards
 - 3) Assessment stock identification priority species
- 4) Estimated Attendance
- 5) Briefing Materials

Meeting Summary

- 1) Date – November 7 – 9, 2017. 9 am Tuesday – 12 noon Thursday
- 2) Location: Atlanta GA
- 3) Workshop Topics Discussion:
 - It was noted that the methods presented to the SAFMC SSC in October 2015 were preliminary/exploratory in nature, and not fully vetted for use as alternative estimation approaches.
 - Additional approaches need to be considered and evaluated.
 - Suggested that the Council may have misunderstood the current state of progress of alternative estimation methods, given the apparent Council expectation that recommendations for applying specific alternative methods to specific stocks could be developed during a November 2017 workshop.
 - Suggested removing the reference to ACLs in topic #1 so the workshop could also consider improvements in estimates used for stock assessments.
 - Recommend addressing this in the write up and TORs, as during prior discussions of this workshop and the estimation issue concerns were raised with a group of this nature dictating how data are used in an assessment. Such decision are now delegated to the assessment teams and data workshops.
 - The Workshop needs to consider how alternative estimation methods might affect management and the management specification process and timing. Need to maintain consistency between the estimates and the management application.
 - Suggested a TOR addressing a review of management approaches, ACL evaluation, and AMs.
 - Noted that MRIP staff did not have the resources to apply the current alternative methods, as well as other alternatives that could be derived, to develop and evaluate alternative estimates prior to the workshop in November.

- MRIP expert consultants can be brought in for the workshop to help develop and evaluate alternative estimation methods.
- Concerns were raised regarding what entity would ultimately apply the alternative methods.
 - Agreed that it was ultimately a NMFS responsibility, but the specifics could not be determined until the actual approaches were known.
- Raised the possibility of using the existing methods (October 2015 SAFMC SSC presentation) as an interim step while others are more fully developed and evaluated.
 - This was not recommended, due to the informal or preliminary status of the alternatives presented at that meeting.
- Any alternative estimation methods will need to be certified by MRIP to be used as official catch estimates.
- It is unlikely that a single alternative estimation exists that can be applied across all species of concern or across all regions.
- The group consented that a viable and appropriate suite of alternative estimation methods could not be adequately developed and evaluated in time for review and developing recommendations by November 2017.
- Discussed a possible late summer (2017) workshop to discuss alternative methods in detail.
- Council support for the workshop was based on the expectation of developing recommendations for applying alternative estimation methods in the near future (i.e. 2018). Councils' may not be in position to commit the resources to an in-person workshop in November 2017 if such a workshop will not be able to provide recommendations on the use of alternative estimation methods for ACL monitoring in the near future.
- Therefore, discussion moved toward appropriate ways forward:
 - Convene a workgroup composed of the organizing committee members, with additional expertise such as state agency representatives, to further define and quantify the issues, and develop and evaluate additional alternative estimation methods.
 - The workgroup can meet via webinar to develop the evaluations necessary to support recommendations for specific alternative methods, likely developed through an in-person workshop as initially proposed.
 - Preliminary charge for the workgroup:
 1. Quantitatively define the issue, including reviewing recent examples of high PSE or potentially anomalous estimates.
 2. Identify a full suite of potential and appropriate solutions
 3. Evaluate alternatives, including simulation and comparison with species considered to have adequate and reliable estimates, and considering the benefits and tradeoffs.
 4. Consider approaches for implementing the recommended alternatives

4) Attendance & 5) Briefing Materials

- Due to the group reaching consensus that it is premature to hold a workshop to develop specific recommendations as envisioned by the Council, there was no further discussion of workshop details.