

**SUMMARY REPORT
FROM THE SAFMC SEDAR COMMITTEE MEETING
Jekyll Island, GA
March 1, 2010**

The SEDAR Committee met March 1st, 2010 at Jekyll Island, GA. The Committee discussed the following items:

1. SEDAR Steering Committee Report

The Committee received a report on the February 8, 2010 SEDAR Steering Committee Meeting. It was noted that the Steering Committee agreed to handle the red snapper assessment as a benchmark, which necessitated delaying the snowy grouper update and the historic catch workshop. Discussion also focused on revision of the independent peer review process and the Steering Committee recommendation to maintain a review workshop separate from an SSC meeting, chaired by an SSC member and including additional SSC representatives on the review panel. The Committee suggested providing exposure to the workshop process and training in meeting chairing to increase the available pool of chairs.

2. SAFMC SEDAR Administrative Process

The Committee reviewed the SAFMC process for addressing SEDAR workshop administrative tasks, such as approving schedules and Terms of Reference and appointing participants. The process was approved for further consideration by the SOPPs Committee.

3. Conflict of Interest Policies

The Committee held a general discussion on conflict of interest, including types of perceived conflicts, the intent of preventing conflicts, and the need to disclose conflicts while not automatically excluding any individual with a perceived conflict. Although conflict of interest is commonly related to financial interests, examples were provided of a wide range of areas creating perceived conflicts, including: (1) geographic, where an individual lives within the range of a species; (2) educational, where an individual educated, or was educated by, another individual involved as a researcher or reviewer; (3) multiple responsibilities, where an individual may fill a council role, such as SSC member, charged with reviewing or interpreting a dataset or analysis prepared by their employing agency; and (4) legal, where an individual may be party to a lawsuit tied to a council action. Lawsuits were recognized as an inherent part of the overall rule making process that might justify careful examination and dedicated policies. It was agreed that many factors could create perceptions of conflict of interest, but not all such perceptions justified exclusion and not all areas of conflict prevented objectivity or positive contributions to the technical process.

Several concepts emerged from the discussion which will provide guidance in further addressing this issue in the future.

- Critical questions to consider in deciding whether an individual should be appointed to a technical or advisory panel should be whether they have information, experience, and expertise that will benefit the process, and whether they can be objective in applying their knowledge and offering recommendations.
- Circumstances leading to real or perceived conflicts of interest should be fully disclosed, but not all such circumstances should result in exclusion.
- Disagreement, including that expressed through the legal process, does not in and of itself create a conflict of interest.

Staff was directed to develop a draft disclosure form for consideration at the next meeting.

4. SEDAR Project Approvals

The Committee approved project schedules and terms of reference, and made workshop appointments, for SEDAR 23, Goliath grouper, and SEDAR 24, South Atlantic red snapper. Appointments for SEDAR 24 are summarized in Table 1.

5. Recommendations for next SEDAR Steering Committee meeting.

The Committee discussed priority stocks for consideration at the next Steering Committee meeting in May 2010, and recommended that the SAFMC request updates for snowy grouper, tilefish, gag, and red porgy in 2011. Issues related to the SEDAR budget will be further discussed by the Executive Finance Committee.

MOTIONS

MOTION #1: ACCEPT THE SEDAR ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL PROCESS AND RECOMMEND IT TO SOPPS CHEUVRONT/CUPKA; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE.

MOTION #2: APPOINT DON DEMARIA AND GREG DEBRANGO TO THE GOLIATH GROUPER ASSESSMENT ROBSON/HARTIG; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #3: APPOINT BEN HARTIG TO THE GOLIATH GROUPER ASSESSMENT GEIGER/ROBSON; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #4: APPROVE GOLIATH GROUPER TERMS OF REFERENCE AND SCHEDULE GEIGER/CUPKA; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #5: APPOINT THE STATE AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES AS NOTED ON THE MODIFIED PARTICIPANT LIST TO THE SEDAR 24 WORKSHOPS. GEIGER/CHEUVRONT; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #6. APPOINT THE SSC MEMBERS AS NOTED ON THE MODIFIED PARTICIPANT LIST TO THE SEDAR 24 WORKSHOPS.
CHEUVRONT/ROBSON; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #7. APPOINT THE AP AND AP ALTERNATES AS NOTED ON THE MODIFIED PARTICIPANT LIST TO THE SEDAR 24 WORKSHOPS.
GEIGER/SWATZEL; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #8. APPOINT RUSTY HUDSON TO THE SEDAR 14 DATA WORKSHOP AND FRANK HESTER AND ROBERT JOHNSON TO THE SEDAR 24 DATA AND ASSESSMENT WORKSHOPS.
HARTIG/GEIGER; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #9. APPOINT GEORGE GEIGER AND CHARLIE PHILLIPS TO THE SEDAR 24 WORKSHOPS, AND APPOINT BEN HARTIG TO THE SEDAR 24 DATA WORKSHOP.
CHEUVRONT/CUPKA; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #10. ADD “PROVIDE A WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF THE BIOLOGICAL SAMPLING PROGRAM” TO SEDAR 24 DATA WORKSHOP TOR 2, AND “PROVIDE A WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF THE DISCARD SAMPLING PROGRAM” TO SEDAR 24 DATA WORKSHOP TOR 8.
GEIGER/HARTIG; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #11: APPROVE THE SCHEDULE AND TERMS OF REFERENCE AS MODIFIED BY ABOVE MOTION.
ROBSON/CHEUVRONT; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #12: PROVIDE GUIDANCE FOR THE NEXT SEDAR STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING: REQUEST UPDATES IN 2011 FOR GAG, SNOWY GROUPER, GOLDEN TILEFISH AND RED PORGY
GEIGER/CHEUVRONT; APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

Table 1. Modified Participant list for SEDAR 24 (South Atlantic Red Snapper) containing approved SAMFC workshop appointments.

Name	Affiliation	DW	AW	RW
MOTION 6: APPOINT THE FOLLOWING SSC REPRESENTATIVES TO SEDAR 24:				
John Boreman	SSC			X
Matt Cieri	SSC			X
Chip Collier	SSC	X	X	
Marcel Reichert	SSC	X		
Andy Cooper	SSC		X	
Luiz Barbieri	SSC		X	
Scott Crosson	SSC (Chair)			X
MOTION 5: APPOINT THE FOLLOWING STATE AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES TO SEDAR 24:				
Kathy Knowlton	GA DNR	X		
Julie DeFilippi	ACCSP	X		
Erik Robilliard	GA DNR	X		
Jack Holland	NC DMF	X		
Dave Wyanski	SC DNR	X		
Stephanie McInerny or Alan Bianchi	NC DMF	X		
Julie Califf	GA DNR	X		
David Player	SC DNR	X		
Richard Cody	FL FWC	X		
Julie DeFilipi	ACCSP	X		
Jessica Stephens	SC DNR	X		
Mike Murphy or Behzad Mahmoudi	FL FWC		X	
MOTION 7: APPOINT THE FOLLOWING AP REPRESENTATIVES AND ALTERNATES TO SEDAR 24:				
Zack Bowen	Charter/Headboat GA	X	X	X
Steve Amick	Charter/Headboat GA	X	X	X
Rodney Smith	FL, Recreational	X	X	X

Bobby Cardin	FL, Commercial	X	X	X
Kenny Fex	NC, Commercial	X	X	X
TBD	FL, Recreational	X	X	X
AP Alternates (eligible to fill in if an above appointee cannot attend a workshop)				
Gregg DeBrango	FL, Commercial	X	X	X
Rob Harris	FL, Recreational	X	X	X
Scott Osbourn	FL, Commercial	X	X	X
Andy High	NC, Commercial	X	X	X
Mark Brown	SC, Commercial	X	X	X
MOTION 8: APPOINT THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS TO SEDAR 24:				
Robert Johnson	Charter/Headboat N FL	X	X	
Rusty Hudson	Sustainable Fisheries	X		
Frank Hester	Industry Scientist	X	X	
MOTION #9. APPOINT GEORGE GEIGER AND CHARLIE PHILLIPS TO THE SEDAR 24 WORKSHOPS, AND APPOINT BEN HARTIG TO THE SEDAR 24 DATA WORKSHOP.				
George Geiger		X	X	X
Charlie Phillips		X	X	X
Ben Hartig		X		