

SUMMARY REPORT
FROM THE SNAPPER GROUPEER COMMITTEE MEETING
Charleston, SC
September 15th-17th, 2009

The Snapper Grouper Committee met on September 15th-17th, 2009 in Charleston, SC.

1. Presentations

The Committee received the following presentations: *Oculina* Update (Kim Iverson), Status of Red Snapper Interim Rule (Dr. Jack McGovern), Red Snapper Rebuilding Projections (Dr. Erik Williams), Impact of Recent Regulations/Closed Area Evaluations (Dr. Nick Farmer), Economic Impacts to the Commercial Sector From Proposed Actions in Amendments 17A and 17B (Dr. Jim Waters), and Presentation of Economic Impacts to the Recreational Sector From Proposed Actions in Amendments 17A and 17B (Dr. Tony Lamberte).

2. Amendment 17A, Rick DeVictor, SAFMC Staff

Council staff presented the alternatives in the amendment, in addition to the Snapper Grouper and Law Enforcement Advisory Panels' recommendations. The Committee reviewed closure area maps that staff developed based upon the Law Enforcement recommendations.

The Committee discussed the implications, including those in terms of economic and social effects, from retaining the current F_{MSY} proxy and from specifying a new one based upon recommendations from the SEDAR Review Panel and SSC. The Committee decided to retain the preferred alternative that would specify a F_{MSY} proxy according to the most recent SEDAR/SSC recommendation; this level is equivalent to that at the $F_{40\%SPR}$ level. In addition, the Committee directed staff to combine actions that would specify *optimum yield* and the *rebuilding strategy* as both actions achieve the same purpose of specifying the rebuilding goal by choosing a fishing mortality rate. The Committee developed accountability measures for red snapper and discussed the problems with monitoring the rebuilding biomass with self-reported discard data.

The Committee also reviewed ten proposed alternatives, including the preliminary analyses investigating the biological effects and feasibility of each, that have come forward from the Snapper Grouper Advisory Panel and public since the June 2009 Council meeting. Among these alternatives were ideas to specify days-at-sea, allocate the red snapper ACL by state and sector,

reduce bag limits and specify vessel limits, and specify a tag system for the recreational sector. The Council added an alternative for public hearings that would allocate the red snapper ACL as non-directed removals to the three sectors, would establish a designated snapper grouper bottom fishing zone in the South Atlantic, and would require real-time electronic reporting and VMS for those permitted to fish in the area. The details of this alternative are outlined in Motion #44. The Committee decided to add an alternative that would analyze the use of circle hooks for all snapper grouper species at the northern end of the closed blocks and another alternative that would require circle hooks throughout the entire EEZ for the snapper grouper fishery. The Council approved Amendment 17A for public hearings. The details of direction to staff and the team are provided in the motions.

3. Amendment 17B, Rick DeVictor, SAFMC Staff

Council staff presented the alternatives in the amendment, in addition to the Snapper Grouper and Law Enforcement Advisory Panels' recommendations. The Committee reviewed maps that displayed the closure beginning at approximately the 240 ft depth contour that staff developed based upon the Law Enforcement recommendations. The Committee reviewed an action that would specify the golden tilefish allocation. The Council approved Amendment 17B for public hearings. The details of direction to staff and the team are provided in the motions.

4. Amendment 18 – Kate Quigley, SAFMC Staff

Council staff presented the alternatives in the amendment, in addition to the Snapper Grouper and Law Enforcement Advisory Panels' recommendations. The Council approved Amendment 18 for public hearings. The details of direction to staff and the team are provided in the motions.

5. Amendment 20 – Kate Quigley, SAFMC Staff

Council staff presented the alternatives in the amendment, in addition to the Snapper Grouper and Law Enforcement Advisory Panels' recommendations. Staff will revise the program review. The details are provided in the motions.

6. Comprehensive ACL Amendment, Rick DeVictor, SAFMC Staff

Rick DeVictor presented guidance from National Standards Guidance 1, 3 and 7 in terms of either designation species as Ecosystem Component species or removing species from the Fishery Management Unit (FMU). The Council directed staff to add various alternatives that would either designate some species as Ecosystem Component species or remove some from the FMU. The specific alternatives are outlined in the motions. These alternatives would investigate the ratio between landings in state and Federal waters, the level of commercial landings, and state regulations. The Council added an action that would investigate changing the current commercial trip limit of 1,000 lbs for greater amberjack.

7. Fishery Independent Monitoring Workshop

The Committee discussed the workshop to be held in November, and selected members of the fishing community to participate in the workshop.

8. Other Business

South Carolina members of the Council raised concerns over the level of commercial landings in Special Management Zones. The Council decided to add an action to Amendment 18 that would change the regulations in these areas. Alternatives include limiting harvest to all users to the bag limit and for NMFS to delegate management authority of management zones to the respective states.

The committee approved the following motions:

AMENDMENT 17A

MOTION #1: CHANGE PREFERRED MSY ALTERNATIVE FROM F40%SPR TO F30%SPR.

DISAPPROVED BY COMMITTEE

**MOTION #2: ADOPT ALTERNATIVE 2 (ACL=82,000 LB WHOLE WEIGHT).
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #3: MOVE TO RECONSIDER MOTION 2.
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #4: TABLE MOTION #2 (APPROVE ALTERNATIVE 2 AS PREFERRED)
MOTION TO TABLE
MOTION WITHDRAWN**

**MOTION #5: MOTION #2 IS WITHDRAWN BECAUSE THERE ARE INCORRECT
NUMBERS IN THE ALTERNATIVE
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #6: SET REBUILDING STRATEGY ALTERNATIVE 4 AS PREFERRED, AT
75%FMSY (75%F40%) USING THE VERY HIGH RECRUITMENT WHICH RESULTS
IN THE ACL BEING 79,000 POUNDS WHOLE WEIGHT
AMEND MOTION TO ADOPT THE VERY HIGH RECRUITMENT IN THE
CALCULATIONS OF ALL ALTERNATIVES IN THE DOCUMENT
AMENDMENT APPROVED BY COMMITTEE
MAIN MOTION APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #7: ESTABLISH ALTERNATIVE 7C AS OUR PREFERRED REBUILDING
STRATEGY; ACL = 0 LANDINGS. THE AM WOULD TRACK CPUE.
MOTION WITHDRAWN**

**MOTION #8: SEPARATE BLACK SEABASS AND GOLDEN TILEFISH FROM THE
EXISTING ALTERNATIVES AND PUT EACH SPECIES INTO THEIR OWN
ALTERNATIVE
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #9: ADD AN ALTERNATIVE THAT WOULD PROHIBIT SPEARFISHING
IN THE CLOSURE AREA
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #10: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 1 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT
REJECTED ALTERNATIVES
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

MOTION #11: INCLUDE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 2 IN AMENDMENT 17A TO ALLOW FOR ALLEYS BUT NO DEEPER THAN 150 FOOT DEPTH APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #12: TABLE MOTION #11 APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #13: UNTABLE MOTION: MOTION #11: ADD PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 2 TO ALLOW FOR ALLEYS BUT NO DEEPER THAN 150 FOOT DEPTH.

MOTION #14: ADD PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 2 TO ALLOW FOR ALLEYS BUT NO DEEPER THAN 150 FOOT DEPTH. DISAPPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #15: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 3 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

**AMENDMENT TO MOTION WITHDRAWN:
EXCEPT THAT REMOVAL OF THE MINIMUM SIZE LIMIT WOULD BE ANALYZED**

MOTION #16: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 4 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #17: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 5 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #18: ADD PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 6 TO THE ALTERNATIVES IN AMENDMENT 17A.

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #19: TABLE MOTION #18.

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION TO UNTABLE #18

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #18 DISAPPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #20: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 6 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED APPENDIX

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #21: INCLUDE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 7 [LESS THE “NO NEW CLOSED AREAS”] IN THE LIST OF ALTERNATIVES FOR AMENDMENT 17A. WHEN ANALYZED EXCLUDE NORTH OF THE NC/SC BORDER AND SOUTHERN FLORIDA.

DISAPPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #22: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 8 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #23: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 9 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #24: MOVE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 10 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED ALTERNATIVES

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #25: ADD THE AM LANGUAGE IN ALT 7 TO ALTERNATIVES 2-6 AND TO ALSO CRAFT AM LANGUAGE FOR THE CB/HB MONITORING PROGRAM IN TERMS OF TRACKING THE CPUE VIA THAT PROGRAM TO TRACK THE CHANGE IN BIOMASS. ALSO REVISIT THE SIZE OF THE CLOSURES WHEN THE DISCARDS ARE ESTIMATED TO EXCEED THE ACL.

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #26: ADD AN ALTERNATIVE TO ANALYZE USE OF CIRCLE HOOKS FOR ALL SNAPPER GROUPER SPECIES NORTH OF 28 DEGREES NORTH APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #27: TABLE MOTION #26 APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION: UNTABLE MOTION #26 APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #28: ADD AN ALTERNATIVE TO ANALYZE USE OF CIRCLE HOOKS FOR ALL SNAPPER GROUPER SPECIES NORTH OF 28 DEGREES NORTH MOTION TO AMEND THE MOTION TO ADD NORTHERN BOUNDARY AT THE NORTHERN END OF THE CLOSED BLOCKS AMENDMENT APPROVED BY COMMITTEE AMENDED MOTION APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #29: PROPOSE USE OF CIRCLE HOOKS IN THE ENTIRE SAFMC EEZ FOR THE SNAPPER GROUPER FISHERY APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #30: FOR THE COMMERCIAL SECTOR: (A) COMMERCIAL ACT = 30-32% OF 79,000 (ACL); (B) DEDUCT BYCATCH IN NORTH CAROLINA AND SOUTH FLORIDA; (C) IMPLEMENT VMS (FISHERMEN PURCHASE UNIT AND PAY OPERATIONAL COSTS; NOT REQUIRED FOR THOSE FISHING IN WATERS OFF NC AND SOUTH FLORIDA), REAL-TIME ELECTRONIC BYCATCH REPORTING AND/OR VIDEO MONITORING AND OBSERVERS; (D) REMOVE SIZE LIMIT

MOTION: TABLE MOTION #30 FOR FULL COUNCIL APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION: UNTABLE MOTION #30.

MOTION: WITHDRAWL MOTION #30 APPROVED BY COUNCIL

AMENDMENT 17B

MOTION #31: ADD AN ALTERNATIVE THAT MIRRORS ALTERNATIVE 4 BUT MOVES THE DEEPWATER CLOSURE TO 300 FT (50 FATHOMS) TO THE EASTERN BOUNDARY OF THE EEZ.

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

**MOTION #32: ADOPT GOLDEN TILEFISH ALLOCATION ALTERNATIVE 4 AS PREFERRED (97% COMMERCIAL AND 3% RECREATIONAL) AND MOVE ALTERNATIVE 2 TO THE CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED APPENDIX.
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE WITH 1 ABSTENTION**

**MOTION #33: ADD AN ALTERNATIVE TO ESTABLISH A TAG PROGRAM FOR THE GOLDEN TILEFISH RECREATIONAL FISHERY
DISAPPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #34: INCLUDE ALTERNATIVE 5C IN THE AM ALTERNATIVES FOR BLACK GROUPER, BLACK SEA BASS, GAG, RED GROUPER, AND VERMILION
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #35: ADD SPECIES SPECIFIC AND AGGREGATE QUOTAS IN FRONT OF QUOTA IN FRAMEWORK ITEM 8.d.
MOTION WITHDRAWN**

**MOTION #36: MOVE SNAPPER GROUPER AMENDMENT 17B FOR PUBLIC HEARINGS
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

AMENDMENT 18

**MOTION #37: ESTABLISH A MANAGEMENT REGIME SIMILAR TO HOW GULF GROUP KING MACKEREL NORTHERN ZONE IS MANAGED.
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #38: ADD SUB-ALTERNATIVES 3C, 3D, 3E, 3G, 3H, 3I, 3J TO THE AMENDMENT IN TERMS OF THE LIMITING GOLDEN TILEFISH EFFORT AND PARTICIPATION ACTION
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

**MOTION #39: CHANGE ALTERNATIVE 7A TO ALTERNATIVE 8 FOR THE ACTION TO MODIFY MANAGEMENT OF BLACK SEA BASS POT FISHERY ACTION.
APPROVED BY COMMITTEE**

MOTION #40: INCLUDE ALTERNATIVE 6 AS AN ALTERNATIVE: Alternative 6. PROVIDE THE OPTION FOR FISHERMEN TO SUBMIT THEIR LOGBOOK ENTRIES ELECTRONICALLY VIA AN ELECTRONIC VERSION OF THE LOGBOOK MADE AVAILABLE ONLINE. APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

MOTION #41: APPROVE AMENDMENT 18 FOR PUBLIC HEARING. APPROVED BY COMMITTEE

**MOTION #42: FOR COMMERCIAL ONLY:
NO CLOSED AREAS. COMMERCIAL ANNUAL CATCH TARGET = 40%(ANNUAL CATCH LIMIT)=40%(61,000 LBS WHOLE WEIGHT)=24,400 LBS WHOLE WEIGHT. IMPLEMENT THE FOLLOWING MONITORING DEVICES: VMS, REAL-TIME ELECTRONIC BYCATCH REPORTING, AND OBSERVERS. IF DISCARDS ARE GREATER THAN 24,400 LBS, PROHIBIT THE USE OF HOOK AND LINE GEAR FOR FISHING FOR MID-SHELF SPECIES. SPEARFISHING AND BLACK SEA BASS POTS WOULD BE ALLOWED. IF BYCATCH REPORTING IS VIOLATED, LOSE PERMIT. ALSO INVESTIGATE A SMALLER CLOSURE IF RED SNAPPER ACL IS MET BUT INCLUDE A QUOTA BUFFER FROM THE 24,400 LBS TO ACCOUNT FOR THE RED SNAPPER MORTALITY.**

MOTION #43: TABLE MOTION #42 UNTIL FULL COUNCIL.

Full Council approved the following motions concerning snapper grouper management:

MOTION #44: ADD TO THE AMENDMENT: ALLOCATE THE 79,000 LB ACL AS NON-DIRECTED REMOVALS; I.E., BYCATCH MORTALITY, BETWEEN THE CLOSURE AREA AND THE EXEMPTED AREA
EXEMPTED AREA: TAKE THE POUNDAGE ALLOTMENT FOR AREA SOUTH OF 28 DEGREES NORTH AND NORTH OF 33 DEGREES NORTH (CAPE ROMAIN), OFF THE 79,000 LB.
CLOSURE AREA: ALLOCATE THE REMAINING POUNDAGE (79,000-29,905 LBS) AS DIRECTED REMOVALS TO THE THREE SECTORS BASED ON TABLE 2, ALTERNATIVE 3, ATTACHMENT 30.
28% - COMMERCIAL: 8,373 LBS
29% - FOR HIRE: 8,672 LBS
43% - RECREATIONAL: 12,859 LBS

Establish a limited, designated snapper-grouper bottom fishing zone in the South Atlantic between 28 degrees N and 33 degrees N.

Issue permits for a limited # of boats from each sector i.e., private recreational, for-hire inclusive of charter and headboat, and commercial, to bottom fish with hook and line [with circle hooks?] in the fishing the established snapper-grouper fishing zone.

Permittees for the designated fishing zone would be selected by a lottery system. (Details to be inserted)

The following accountability measures would be required:

Commercial sector :

VMS

Real time electronic bycatch reporting via electronic logbooks or team alternative real time reporting technology

Video monitoring or observers

For hire sector (charter and headboat)

Mandatory species ID training

VMS

Real time catch (directed and non-directed) reporting via logbooks??

Private recreational sector

Mandatory species ID training

VMS

Real time text message reporting of catch (B1s and B2s)

A subset of each sector would be selected by the SEFSC to bring in red snapper for biological sampling.

If reporting requirements are violated, the permit would be revoked.

Permit issuance:

The NMFS SERO shall issue permits in the initial or any subsequent permit year by lottery devised and operated by the agency.

For reference, the following is a link to GADNR's regulations for issuing lottery licenses.

<http://rules.sos.state.ga.us/docs/391/2/4/10.pdf>

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #45: APPROVE AMENDMENT 17A FOR PUBLIC HEARING.

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

AMENDMENT 20

MOTION #46:

FOR OPTION 3/ACTION 2, IF THE CONFIDENTIALITY PROBLEMS ARE ADDRESSED AND IF ALLOWED TO INCLUDE LANDINGS FROM 2001 AND 2003, THAT THE MSY VALUES INCLUDE LANDINGS FROM THESE YEARS APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #47: INCLUDE AN ALTERNATIVE THAT APPLIES THE ABC CONTROL RULE METHODOLOGY DEVELOPED BY THE SSC TO THE TIMESERIES IN THE DOCUMENT UNDER THE MSY ALTERNATIVES APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #48: INCLUDE A SUITE OF ALLOCATION ALTERNATIVES IN THE AMENDMENT:

90% COMM/10% REC

95% COMM/5% REC

100% COMM/0 % REC

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #49: DIRECT STAFF TO INCLUDE ALTERNATIVES AS PER ACTIONS 1-5. ALSO INCLUDE ALTERNATIVES FOR RESOURCE RENT.

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #50: DIRECT STAFF TO INCLUDE A SUITE OF ALTERNATIVES FOR A SUNSET PROVISION IN ADDITION TO THE ITEMS IN THE PREVIOUS MOTION APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #51: INCLUDE A SUITE OF ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD ALLOW NON ITQ PERMITEES (WITH SNAPPER GROUPER COMMERCIAL PERMIT) TO BUY/POSSESS COUPONS.

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

COMPREHENSIVE ACL AMENDMENT

MOTION #52: ADD ALTERNATIVES THAT CONSIDER SPECIES THAT ARE LESS THAN OR EQUAL TO:

ALT. 1: 1000 LBS (STATE & FEDERAL LANDINGS)

ALT. 2: 2500 LBS

ALT 3: 5000 LBS AS ECOSYSTEM COMPONENT SPECIES

ALSO ADD THE FOLLOWING ALTERNATIVES

ALT 4:. 95% CAUGHT IN STATE WATERS BE TAKEN OUT OF FMU

ALT 5: 90% CAUGHT IN STATE WATERS BE TAKEN OUT OF FMU

ALT 5: 80% CAUGHT IN STATE WATERS BE TAKEN OUT OF FMU

APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #53: ALSO ADD ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD REMOVE SPECIES FROM THE FMU THAT ARE MANAGED UNDER THE MARINE LIFE RULE IN FL. APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #54: STAFF TO DEVELOP ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD CONSIDER MULTI-SPECIES GROUPINGS IN THE AMENDMENT APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #55: STAFF DEVELOP ALTERNATIVES TO INVESTIGATE CHANGING THE GREATER AMBERJACK COMMERCIAL TRIP LIMIT. POSSIBLE ALTERNATIVES: 2,000 LB, 1,500, AND ELIMINATING THE TRIP (INCLUDE NO ACTION) APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #56: APPOINT THE 5 AP MEMBERS THAT HAVE AGREED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE FISHERY INDEPENDENT MONITORING WORKSHOP. ADD 1 REPRESENTATIVE FROM SC AND 1 FROM NE FLORIDA. APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #57: THE COUNCIL, BY APPROPRIATE VEHICLE, ESTABLISH REGULATIONS WHERE FISHING IN SPECIAL MANAGEMENT ZONES (SMZS) BY ALL USERS IN SOUTH CAROLINA BE LIMITED TO THE BAG LIMIT APPROVED BY COUNCIL

MOTION #58: INCLUDE AN ALTERNATIVE IN AMENDMENT 18 FOR NMFS TO DELEGATE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY OF MANAGEMENT ZONES TO THE RESPECTIVE STATES. APPROVED BY COUNCIL