

**APPENDIX A. ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED BUT ELIMINATED FROM DETAILED ANALYSIS**

**Rejected Alternative 1.** Define a rebuilding strategy for red grouper that sets  $F_{OY}$  equal to  $85\% F_{MSY}$ . Under this strategy, the fishery would have at least a 50% chance of rebuilding to  $SSB_{MSY}$  by 2018 and 64% chance of rebuilding to  $SSB_{MSY}$  by 2020.

- The Optimum Yield at equilibrium would be 1,103,000 lbs whole weight (landed catch).
- The Overfishing Level is 669,000 lbs whole weight with dead discards and 617,000 lbs whole weight without dead discards.
- The Acceptable Biological Catch recommendation from the Scientific and Statistical Committee for 2011 is 665,000 lbs whole weight with dead discards and 622,000 lbs whole weight without dead discards.
- The Annual Catch Limit would be 668,000 lbs whole weight with dead discards and 643,000 lbs whole weight without dead discards.

*Reason for elimination:* The Annual Catch Limit specified in this alternative is greater than Scientific and Statistical Committee’s recommendation for the Acceptable Biological Catch.

**Rejected Alternative 2.**

**Table 2-9.** Projection results if the fishing mortality rate is fixed at  $F = 85\%F_{MSY}$ . The maximum red grouper kill under this projection is 668,000 lbs whole weight.

| Year          | F(per year) | Probability of Rebuilt Stock | Maximum Allowable Kill |          |           |
|---------------|-------------|------------------------------|------------------------|----------|-----------|
|               |             |                              | Landings               | Discards | Total     |
| 2009          | 0.298       | 0                            | 1,098,000              | 61,000   | 1,159,000 |
| 2010          | 0.298       | 0                            | 985,000                | 70,000   | 1,055,000 |
| 2011 (Year 1) | 0.188       | 0.01                         | 643,000                | 45,000   | 688,000   |
| 2012          | 0.188       | 0.06                         | 714,000                | 45,000   | 759,000   |
| 2013          | 0.188       | 0.14                         | 781,000                | 46,000   | 827,000   |
| 2014          | 0.188       | 0.23                         | 839,000                | 46,000   | 885,000   |
| 2015          | 0.188       | 0.33                         | 888,000                | 46,000   | 934,000   |
| 2016          | 0.188       | 0.42                         | 930,000                | 47,000   | 977,000   |
| 2017          | 0.188       | 0.49                         | 964,000                | 47,000   | 1,011,000 |
| 2018          | 0.188       | 0.55                         | 991,000                | 47,000   | 1,038,000 |
| 2019          | 0.188       | 0.6                          | 1,014,000              | 47,000   | 1,061,000 |
| 2020          | 0.188       | 0.64                         | 1,032,000              | 47,000   | 1,079,000 |

**Alternative 1 (No Action).** Retain the existing regulations for red grouper (Table X).

**Table 2-15.** Existing regulations and those proposed in Amendment 17B for red grouper.

| Current Regulations |            |   |
|---------------------|------------|---|
|                     | Commercial | Recreational  |
| Bag limit           |            | Three grouper aggregate bag limit per person per day. Exclude the |

|   |  |   |
|---|--|---|
|   |  | captain and crew on for-hire vessels from possessing a bag limit for groupers   |
| In-season closures                              | Gag commercial ACL of 352,940 lbs gutted weight. After the commercial ACL is met, all purchase and sale of the following species is prohibited and harvest and/or possession is limited to the bag limit: gag; black grouper; red grouper; scamp; red hind; rock hind; yellowmouth grouper; tiger grouper; yellowfin grouper; graysby; and coney.  |   |
| Minimum size limit                              | 20 inch total length   |   |
| Seasonal closure                                | No fishing for and/or possession of the following species is allowed January through April: black grouper; red grouper; scamp; red hind; rock hind; yellowmouth grouper; tiger grouper; yellowfin grouper; graysby, and coney.   |   |
| <b>Regulations implemented by Amendment 17B</b> |  |   |
|   | <b>Commercial</b>  | <b>Recreational</b>   |
|   | In addition to the gag sector-ACLs, establish an ACL for gag, black grouper, and red grouper of 662,403 lbs gutted weight (commercial) and 648,663 lbs gutted weight (recreational). The table below shows how the aggregate ACL was calculated. Prohibit the commercial possession of shallow water groupers when the gag or the gag, black grouper, and red grouper when the ACL is projected to be met. | Establish a recreational ACL for gag, black grouper, and red grouper of 648,663 lbs gutted weight. If at least one of the species (gag, red grouper, or black grouper) <i>is overfished</i> and the sector ACL is projected to be met, prohibit the harvest and retention of the species or species group. If the ACL is exceeded, independent of stock status, the Regional Administrator shall publish a notice to reduce the sector ACL in the following year by the amount of the overage. For black grouper, black sea bass, gag, red grouper, and vermilion snapper, compare the recreational ACL with recreational landings over a range of years. For 2010, use only 2010 landings. For 2011, use the average landings of 2010 and 2011. For 2012 and beyond, use the most recent three-year running average. |

*Commercial*

**Alternative 2 (Preferred).** After the commercial ACL is met, all purchase and sale of red grouper is prohibited and harvest and/or possession is limited to the bag limit.

**Alternative 3 (Preferred).** If the commercial sector ACL is exceeded, the Regional Administrator shall publish a notice to reduce the commercial sector ACL in the following season by the amount of the overage.

*Recreational*

**Alternative 4 (Preferred).** For post-season accountability measures, compare recreational ACL with recreational landings over a range of years. For 2011, use only 2011 landings. For 2012, use the average landings of 2011 and 2012. For 2013 and beyond, use the most recent three-year running average.

**Alternative 5 (Preferred).** The Regional Administrator shall publish a notice to close the recreational fishery when the ACL is projected to be met.

**Alternative 6 (Preferred).** Take corrective action if the recreational ACL has been exceeded.

**Option 6a (Preferred).** If the recreational sector ACL is exceeded, the Regional Administrator shall publish a notice to reduce the recreational sector ACL in the following season by the amount of the overage.

**Option 6b.** If the recreational sector ACL is exceeded, the Regional Administrator shall publish a notice to reduce the length of the following fishing year by the amount necessary to ensure landings do not exceed the recreational sector ACL for the following fishing year.

*Reason for elimination:* The Council decided to add this action to the Comprehensive ACL Amendment as that amendment is proposing establish ACLs and AMs for a shallow water grouper unit (which includes red grouper).